

Passive temperature tomography experiments to characterize transmissivity and connectivity of preferential flow paths in fractured media

Maria Klepikova, Tanguy Le Borgne, Olivier Bour, Kerry Gallagher, Rebecca Hochreutener, Nicolas Lavenant

▶ To cite this version:

Maria Klepikova, Tanguy Le Borgne, Olivier Bour, Kerry Gallagher, Rebecca Hochreutener, et al.. Passive temperature tomography experiments to characterize transmissivity and connectivity of preferential flow paths in fractured media. Journal of Hydrology, 2014, 512, pp.549-562. 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2014.03.018. insu-00979609

HAL Id: insu-00979609 https://insu.hal.science/insu-00979609v1

Submitted on 16 Apr 2014

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Passive temperature tomography experiments to 1 characterize transmissivity and connectivity of 2 preferential flow paths in fractured media 3 Maria V. Klepikova^{a,b,*}, Tanguy Le Borgne^a, Olivier Bour^a, Kerry 4 Gallagher^a, Rebecca Hochreutener^a, Nicolas Lavenant^a 5 ^aGéosciences Rennes, OSUR, UMR CNRS 6118, University of Rennes 1, Rennes, 6 France. ^bNow at University of Liege, ArGEnCo, GEO³, Hydrogeology and Environmental 8 Geology, B52/3 Sart-Tilman, 4000 Liege, Belgium 9

10 Abstract

The detection of preferential flow paths and the characterization of their 11 hydraulic properties are major challenges in fractured rock hydrology. In this 12 study, we propose to use temperature as a passive tracer to characterize frac-13 ture connectivity and hydraulic properties. In particular, we propose a new 14 temperature tomography field method in which borehole temperature profiles 15 are measured under different pumping conditions by changing successively 16 the pumping and observation boreholes. To interpret these temperature-17 depth profiles, we propose a three step inversion-based framework. We con-18 sider first an inverse model that allows for automatic permeable fracture de-19 tection from borehole temperature profiles under pumping conditions. Then 20 we apply a borehole-scale flow and temperature model to produce flowmeter 21 profiles by inversion of temperature profiles. This second step uses inversion 22 to characterise the relationship between temperature variations with depth and borehole flow velocities (*Klepikova et al.*, 2011). The third inverse step,

^{*}Corresponding author

PrepEmailuddinesa tek Jepikavo Pulgirologie (Maria V. Klepikova) March 11, 2014

which exploits cross-borehole flowmeter tests, is aimed at inferring inter-25 borehole fracture connectivity and transmissivities. This multi-step inverse 26 framework provides a means of including temperature profiles to image frac-27 ture hydraulic properties and connectivity. We test the proposed approach 28 with field data obtained from the Ploemeur (N.W. France) fractured rock 29 aquifer, where the full temperature tomography experiment was carried out 30 between three 100 meter depth boreholes 10 meters apart. We identified sev-31 eral transmissive fractures and their connectivity which correspond to known 32 fractures and corroborate well with independent information, including avail-33 able borehole flowmeter tests and geophysical data. Hence, although indirect, 34 temperature tomography appears to be a promising approach for character-35 izing connectivity patterns and transmissivities of the main flow paths in 36 fractured rock. 37

38 Keywords: Temperature, Fracture, Borehole Velocity, Inverse Model

³⁹ 1. Introduction

The accurate prediction of fluid flow in fractured media is a challenging 40 problem, as flow may be localized in few small fractures with heterogeneities 41 at all scales (e.g. Berkowitz, 2002). The classical approach to infer detailed 42 flow properties relies on the identification of the flowing fractures followed 43 by hydraulic testing with packers (e.g. Shapiro and Hsieh, 1998). Recent nu-44 merical developments (e.g. Yeh and Liu, 2000; Brauchler et al., 2003; Illman 45 et al., 2009; Berg and Illman, 2013) have significantly improved hydraulic 46 tomography methods in fractured media. However, spatial resolution of the 47 inferred tomograms strongly depends on the number of observation intervals 48

(Sharmeen et al., 2012). Furthermore, this approach requires the installation
of packers which is often not possible. To avoid these practical issues, we can
consider other types of data that can be more easily obtained and that are
directly sensitive to ground water flow.

Temperature data meet these conditions as geothermal heat can be con-53 sidered as a natural tracer of groundwater flow (Anderson, 2005; Saar, 2011). 54 Furthermore, temperature profiles can be obtained easily and continuously in 55 space by logging a temperature probe in the observation borehole. The use 56 of fiber optic technology can also greatly improve the temporal and spatial 57 coverage of borehole temperature measurements (Read et al., 2013). Temper-58 ature data have often been used for inferring vertical or horizontal ground-59 water flow velocities assuming homogeneous aquifer properties (Bredehoeft 60 and Papadopulos, 1965; Reiter, 2001; Anderson, 2005; Saar, 2011). 61

In fractured rocks, abrupt temperature changes are often observed at spe-62 cific depths (e.g. Ge, 1998; Bense et al., 2008; Chatelier et al., 2011). When 63 groundwater flow occurs within a permeable fracture, it may perturb the 64 temperature profile within and around the fracture due to advected flow car-65 rying either warmer or cooler fluid (Ge, 1998). In large-scale faults, velocities 66 can be large enough to influence the regional heat flux distribution (*Demina*, 67 1993; Ge, 1998; Anderson, 2005; Saar, 2011). Moreover, ambient flow in 68 boreholes themselves, that arises due to the difference in hydraulic heads be-69 tween fractures intersecting the borehole, affects temperature borehole logs 70 (Bidaux and Drogue, 1993; Pehme, 2010; Klepikova et al., 2011). A few 71 studies have considered borehole temperature profiles in fractured rocks un-72 der induced fluid flow conditions (Flynn, 1985; Silliman, 1989). Among them 73

Silliman (1989) argued that temperature anomalies produced by pumping in adjacent boreholes can be used for initial estimates of fractures connecting a given 'pumping-observation' borehole pair. Few of these studies, however, were able to quantify the fracture hydraulic properties or describe how these fractures form different flow paths. This is the objective of this study.

Recently, we have shown how borehole temperature gradients may be 79 sensitive to vertical borehole flow velocities (Klepikova et al., 2011). By ap-80 plying a fluid flow and heat transfer forward numerical model, we were able 81 to obtain borehole flow profiles under ambient, pumping (while pumping at 82 the top of the borehole) and cross-borehole (while pumping in neighboring 83 boreholes) flow conditions from borehole temperature-depth profiles. Fur-84 thermore, such flow profiles can be used to characterize the connectivity and 85 hydraulic properties of the main flow paths in fractured rock (*Paillet*, 1998; 86 Le Borgne et al., 2006). The method is based on the idea that pumping mod-87 ifies hydraulic heads in flow paths intersecting a pumping borehole, which in 88 turn produce changes in vertical borehole flow in observation boreholes. In a 89 recent study, a new inversion method was developed to invert such borehole 90 flow data. This approach, referred as flow tomography (Klepikova et al., 91 2013), was successful in estimating inter borehole fracture hydraulic proper-92 ties as well as fracture connectivity on synthetic examples. Here, we propose 93 to investigate how both approaches may be coupled to invert borehole tem-94 perature data in different flow conditions to estimate fracture connectivity 95 and hydraulic properties between pairs of boreholes. 96

In this contribution, we propose a multi-stage inversion framework to interpret temperature measurements obtained during sequential cross-borehole

pumping tests. We propose to call such experiments as passive temperature 99 tomography experiments. The term "passive" means that temperature is 100 used as a passive tracer without any heat injection, in contrast to the ap-101 proach taken in other recent works (Leaf et al., 2012; Read et al., 2013; 102 Wagner et al., 2013). Although this study makes use of the methodolo-103 gies presented in (Klepikova et al., 2011) and (Klepikova et al., 2013), it 104 presents three novelties with respect to these previous works. First, in the 105 present study we propose a new method for automatic inversion of borehole 106 temperature profiles that significantly facilitate data interpretation. The to-107 mography approach based of borehole temperature measurements presented 108 here is analogous to the flow tomography approach (*Klepikova et al.*, 2013). 109 However, an important advantage of this new method over direct flow mea-110 surements is that temperature can be measured more easily and continuously. 111 Finally, this study presents the first application of this method using a to-112 mographic approach in a fractured rock site. 113

In the first part we briefly review the source of temperature variations in the subsurface and examine under which conditions and assumptions our inverse approach may be applied. We then present the methods used in the inversion procedure. In the third part, we describe the experimental site and the temperature tomography experiment conducted. Finally, we present and discuss the results of the application of the inverse approach to three boreholes from the experimental field site.

121 2. Background and Methodology Proposed

In the near surface, temperature-depth profiles are influenced by seasonal 122 temperature variations of the land surface. Typically, this zone includes the 123 first ten meters below the ground, although this depends on the local ther-124 mal properties. Below this depth, the temperature gradient is influenced by 125 the heat flux, the thermal conductivity of rocks (Freifeld et al., 2008), ra-126 dioactive heat sources (*Perry et al.*, 2006) and longer term climate variations 127 (e.g. *Ferquson*, 2006). Moreover, depending on hydrogeological parameters, 128 groundwater flow may have a significant effect on the subsurface temper-129 ature regime (e.g. Anderson, 2005; Ferguson, 2006). To characterize the 130 factors that control heat transfer in the subsurface, precise measurements of 131 temperature as a function of depth should be considered. 132

In this study we focus on permeable fractured rocks in the upper crust 133 (typically above 200 meters deep), where advection can have a significant 134 effect on the subsurface temperature. We assume that the temperature 135 gradient in the regional rock mass increases monotonically (i.e. constant 136 geothermal gradient) (Klepikova et al., 2011). Given typically small temper-137 ature ranges for this depth, the dependence of viscosity on temperature is 138 neglected. In such media induced or natural localized fracture flow generally 139 creates local temperature anomalies. An example of flow and temperature 140 pattern for two boreholes connected by one main flow path under ambi-141 ent, single and cross-borehole pumping conditions is shown in Figure 1. In 142 such a system, heat is carried by vertical borehole flow and dissipates to 143 the surrounding rocks. Hence, borehole flow under ambient (Figure 1A) and 144 pumping conditions (Figure 1B) significantly disturb the equilibrium bore-145

¹⁴⁶ hole temperature profiles.

Ambient vertical borehole flow is induced by differences in hydraulic head 147 between the different flow paths that intersect observation boreholes (e.g. 148 Pehme, 2010; Klepikova et al., 2011). These differences in hydraulic heads 149 are in general due to regional flow conditions (e.g. Elci et al., 2001) and the 150 resulting vertical borehole flow may significantly disturb the temperature 151 profile (e.g. Chatelier et al., 2011) (well 1, Figure 1A). When pumping in one 152 of the wells, hydraulic head changes occur in the flow path connected to the 153 pumping well. The flow paths connecting a borehole pair transmit hydraulic 154 head variations to the neighbor borehole. This difference in hydraulic heads, 155 in turn, depends on the transmissivities of the connecting fractures. For 156 instance, in Figure 1B the upflow in the observation well 1 is maximum since 157 only the upper fracture is connected and transmits the drawdown induced 158 by pumping, implying a temperature increase in the well 1 in response to 150 pumping from the well 2. In the well 2 (Figure 1B), an increase of the flow 160 velocity above flowing fractures in the pumping borehole implies that the 161 water flowing in the borehole has less time to exchange heat with surrounding 162 rocks hence it also implies temperature profile perturbations. 163

Here we propose a multi-stage tomography approach based on an inverse framework for the interpretation of temperature profiles under combinations of pumping conditions to infer the full connectivity pattern as well as fracture hydraulic properties. The inversion framework proposed in this study has three main steps :

169 170 1. Automatic detection of fracture zones intersecting each borehole by applying changepoint modelling to temperature profiles under ambient

flow conditions and steady pumping flow conditions.

- 2. Coupled fluid flow-heat transfer modelling: inversion of temperature
 profiles under ambient, single and cross-borehole flow conditions to
 derive flow profiles.
- 3. Estimation of fracture hydraulic properties and connectivity between
 and around each borehole pair by applying flow tomography to ambient,
 single and cross-borehole pumping flowmeter profiles obtained from the
 previous step.

The approach is summarized in Figure 2. In the following sections we
detail the main steps.

¹⁸¹ 2.1. Permeable Fracture Identification at Borehole Scale

The first step in inferring the flow pattern between a borehole pair is the 182 detailed characterization of flow properties at the borehole scale. Several 183 methods may be used for identification of permeable/transmissive fractures 184 at the borehole scale. These include, for example, geological/geophysical 185 methods (Genter et al., 1997), such as the inspection of continuous core, 186 caliper data, acoustic and optical televiewing (Barton and Zoback, 1992) 187 and electrical resistivity measurements (Keys, 1979). Other methods include 188 hydraulic testing, such as flowmeter tests (*Paillet*, 1998), including heat-pulse 189 flowmeter (e.g. Le Borque et al., 2007), impeller tests (e.g. Newhouse, 2005), 190 high spatial resolution temperature profiling (Mwenifumbo, 1993; Barton et 191 al., 1995) and flexible liner profiling (Pehme, 2010, 2013). 192

In this study, we propose an automatic permeable fracture identification method based on borehole temperature profiles, that takes the advantage

of the close relationship between the borehole temperature gradient and the 195 vertical borehole flow velocity (Pehme, 2010; Klepikova et al., 2011). An 196 illustration of temperature profiles under ambient and pumping flow condi-197 tions is given in Figure 1. In this example, abrupt changes in temperature 198 gradient occur at depths where transmissive fractures intersect the borehole. 199 As borehole flow in fractured aquifers is characterized by intervals of con-200 stant flow between transmissive fractures (Paillet, 1998), inflow points for 201 each borehole can be therefore identified by inspection of temperature pro-202 files. 203

In the field, however, multiple sources of error such as uncertainty about 204 rock thermal diffusivity, changes in borehole diameter, multiple fracture 205 zones and temperature measurement errors, may influence temperature data 206 (Klepikova et al., 2011). The noise in the temperature measurements re-207 lated to these factors complicates the identification of changes in tempera-208 ture gradient trends and the detection of flowing fractures. To interpret the 209 temperature-depth profiles objectively, we apply a recently proposed change-210 point model (Gallagher et al., 2011). Changepoints can be defined as abrupt 211 changes in trends (such as the mean, gradient or any function) over depth 212 or time. Between changepoints it is assumed that underlying trends in the 213 data are either constant or vary linearly with depth. The goal is to infer the 214 location of changepoints (as well as the noise variance associated with each 215 dataset if desired) in a noisy data series without a priori knowledge of the 216 number of changepoints. Ideally, then, changepoint modelling allows us to 217 identify inflow and outflow zones from temperature profiles. 218

219

The approach uses transdimensional Markov chain Monte Carlo to sam-

ple many possible solutions with different numbers and locations of change-220 points and noise estimates which are either accepted or rejected, based on 221 probabilistic criterion (Gallagher et al., 2011). In general, identification of 222 the location and number of changepoints is directly influenced by the noise 223 level in the data and the variability of the observations about the mean be-224 tween changepoints is indicative of the level of noise. Thus, data with lower 225 noise tend to produce a model with many changepoints, while models with 226 fewer changepoints will be acceptable for data with higher noise. The ap-227 proach is formulated in a Bayesian framework, which naturally balances the 228 noise level with the complexity of the changepoint structure (Gallagher et al., 220 2011). Therefore, given a choice between simple and complex models that 230 provide a similarly adequate fit to the observed data, the models with fewer 231 changepoints will be favored. We demonstrate that application of change-232 point model to temperature profiles allows for automatic fracture detection 233 in a field example. Note, that this result can have also a practical implica-234 tion for hydrocarbon recovery, where temperature logs are commonly used 235 to estimate fluid inflow during hydrocarbon production (e.g. Williams et al., 236 2000). 237

2.2. Inverse Modeling of Borehole Temperature Profiles for Flow Estimation
The second step is the inversion of borehole temperature profiles to flow
profiles. For a borehole with no flow, the downhole temperatures are assumed
to follow the geothermal gradient while a reduced temperature gradient implies an increase of the flow velocity under single or cross-borehole flow conditions (*Klepikova et al.*, 2011). In order to study flow and heat transfer at
the borehole scale, we use a numerical model described in detail in *Klepikova*

²⁴⁵ et al. (2011).

This model considers a cylindrical borehole (with a radius fixed to r_0) surrounded by the rock matrix. The borehole is divided into sections according to the position of flowing fractures inferred from the changepoint modeling (Figure 3). Note, that we do not model the fracture outside the borehole. The model includes heat advection in the borehole with a constant vertical laminar flow and heat dissipation in the surrounding rock matrix. The heat transfer equation under steady state conditions is given by

$$\nabla \cdot (\alpha_i \nabla \theta) - v \nabla \theta = 0, \tag{1}$$

where θ is temperature, v is the borehole flow velocity, $i = \{Fluid, Rock\}$, $\alpha_i = k_i/\rho_i C_i$ is the thermal diffusivity, k_i is the thermal conductivity, C_i is the heat capacity, and ρ_i is the density. At the bottom of each borehole section we impose the borehole flow as the sum of all fractures inflows and outflows below the modeled section (Q_{fr}) . The inflow temperatures (here the bottom temperature for each section) are taken from the measured temperature profile. The rock temperature at the outer vertical boundary is taken from the temperature profile measured in the borehole not affected by vertical flow (the ambient temperature in the rock). The boundary condition at the lower boundary is taken as a background geothermal heat flux (Figure 3).

$$Q = -k_{rock}\gamma,\tag{2}$$

where γ is the background geothermal gradient. The temperature at the upper boundary is taken as the surface temperature (or from other constraints such as the temperature of a sub-horizontal large-scale fracture).

In this study we propose a new method for automatic inversion of borehole temperature profiles, that significantly facilitates data interpretation. In order to invert temperature profiles to infer flow profiles, we couple the forward model of heat and fluid flow at the borehole scale (*Klepikova et al.*, 2011) with an optimization algorithm. The inverse problem consists of estimating the vertical borehole flow velocities that perturb the temperature profiles observed under different flow conditions. The misfit function, FO, which evaluates the difference between direct model simulations and temperature measurements, is given by

$$FO = \frac{1}{\sigma_{\theta}^2} \frac{1}{N_{\theta}} \sum_{1}^{N_{\theta}} \left(\theta_{obs} - \theta_{mod}\right)^2 \tag{3}$$

where θ_{obs} are the observed temperatures, θ_{mod} are the temperatures pre-249 dicted by the model, σ_{θ} is the noise variance associated with temperature 250 data and N_{θ} are the number of temperature observations. As we show later, 251 the typical objective function for this problem is convex and has a global min-252 ima. The optimization problem is solved by the Nelder-Mead Simplex (NMS) 253 algorithm incorporated in the MATLAB optimization Toolbox (Lagarias et 254 al., 2011). The NMS algorithm is a nonlinear fast local search method that 255 does not require derivatives of the objective function and is suited to our 256 problem. 257

The uncertainty in the flow velocity values obtained from temperature profiles depends on the length of the borehole flowing sections, the temperature tool precision, and the flow velocity (*Klepikova et al.*, 2011). In order to consider the whole range of possible flow velocities for which the difference between the simulated and measured temperature is less than the relative

accuracy of the probe, the objective function was normalized to the data error (Equation 6). Thus the magnitude of the data errors influence the value of the objective function and the convergence criteria is reached when the objective function value equals one. Then, when we fit the data, on average, to within the error, all the solutions for which the objective function value is in the order of one are acceptable.

269 2.3. Site Scale Flow Inverse Modeling

Once the borehole flow profiles have been inferred from the tempera-270 ture profiles, these can be used in order to estimate transmissivities of hy-271 draulically active fractures between and around the pumping and observation 272 boreholes (Paillet, 1998; Le Borgne et al., 2007; Paillet et al., 2012). At the 273 borehole scale, pumping induces flow in the different fractures intersecting 274 the pumping borehole (Figure 1B). The resulting vertical flow depends on 275 fracture transmissivities locally to the borehole. At larger scale, pumping 276 induces hydraulic head variations in flow paths, which in turn drives vertical 277 flow variations between the fractures intersecting the observation borehole. 278 The induced vertical flow in the observation borehole depends on the differ-279 ent transmissivities of connecting fractures. In particular, the magnitude and 280 the direction of the vertical flow velocity depends on the difference between 281 transmissivities of fractures that connect the borehole as well as transmis-282 sivilies of fractures that interconnect fractures connected to the borehole 283 (Klepikova et al., 2013). 284

Fracture networks often have several sets of fracture connections and interpretations of the results are not straightforward. Recently, we have proposed an inverse modelling framework for flow tomography data that invert

single- and cross-borehole flow profiles in order to estimate transmissivities of hydraulically active fractures between and around the pumping and observation boreholes (*Klepikova et al.*, 2013). This inverse modelling approach uses a 3-D steady state numerical flow model (with 2-D flow in each fracture) to reproduce borehole flow profiles and borehole drawdowns in a fracture network. We assume a Darcy flow in the fractures, and the volume flow rate per unit fracture length on the fracture is given by

$$u = -\frac{k}{\mu}d\nabla p,\tag{4}$$

where k describes the fracture permeability (m^2) , d is the fracture aperture (m). Each fracture is characterized by a value of transmissivity T, which is given by

$$T = d \frac{k\rho g}{\mu}.$$
 (5)

We apply zero-head boundary conditions, that means that no ambient flow takes place in the boreholes. Hence, the model results can be compared to field data, with the ambient flow profile substracted from the pumping profiles (*Paillet*, 1998). In the following flow models, the fracture aperture is fixed at $d = 1 \cdot 10^{-3} m$, which is a realistic value as deduced from tracer tests conducted on the same site. To estimate the fracture transmissivities from the cross-borehole flow profiles inferred from the temperature profiles and drawdown measurements we coupled the direct flow model with a quasi-Newton optimization algorithm. The misfit function, *FO*, which evaluates the difference between flow model simulations and observations, is given by

$$FO = \frac{1}{\sigma_s^2} \frac{1}{N_s} \sum_{0}^{N_s} \left(s_{obs} - s_{mod} \right)^2 + \frac{1}{\sigma_v^2} \frac{1}{N_v} \sum_{0}^{N_v} \left(v_{obs} - v_{mod} \right)^2, \qquad (6)$$

where v_{obs} and s_{obs} are the flowmeter and drawdown observations, σ_v and σ_s are data errors for flow and drawdown respectively, N_v and N_s are the numbers of observations for flow and drawdown respectively, v_{mod} and s_{mod} are the velocity and drawdown predicted by the model.

We use a simplified fracture network model that attempts to reproduce 299 basic fracture network connectivity without representing explicitly the com-300 plete fracture geometry (length, orientation, dip). Solving the fracture net-301 work geometry is not expected to be possible without additional geophysical 302 data and so we refer to the effective or apparent connectivity to highlight the 303 simplification. In the fracture network model, the observation and pumping 304 boreholes are both intersected by horizontal fractures that represent frac-305 tures identified previously at borehole-scale (Section 2.1). The horizontal 306 fractures are connected by a vertical fracture equidistant from both bore-307 holes, which allows to take into account cross connections between fractures. 308 The apparent or effective connectivity between boreholes is simply controlled 309 by attributing different values of transmissivity to the different sections of 310 the vertical fracture. 311

An example of the simplified fracture network is given in Figure 2d. We 312 first define local transmissivities of each fracture zone intersecting the ob-313 servation and pumping boreholes $(T_{B1-1,2} \text{ and } T_{B2-1,2} \text{ in Figure 2d})$ through 314 the inversion of ambient and steady pumping single-borehole flow profiles. 315 In this case the number of parameters $(T_{B1-1,2} \text{ and } T_{B2-1,2})$ equals to the 316 number of observations (1 drawdown and 1 vertical borehole flow velocity 317 for each well). Then, the inverse approach adjusts transmissivities of the 318 different sections of the vertical fracture $(T_1, T_2 \text{ and } T_3 \text{ in Figure 2d})$, so 319

that the simulated cross-borehole profile and drawdown in observation well 320 matches the data. In order to reduce the uncertainty in the model calibra-321 tion, we perform a joint inversion of two pumping tests where the pumping 322 and observation boreholes are reversed for each pair of boreholes. We thus 323 use 4 observations $(s_1, s_2, v_1 \text{ and } v_2)$ in order to determine 3 parameters. 324 Furthermore, we believe that more complex fracture connection patterns in 325 the interval between the boreholes could be approximated by combination 326 of basic kinds of connections and we introduce an order of complexity that 327 matches the information content of the data. These steps allow the inference 328 of the apparent connectivity and transmissivities of the main flow paths as 329 well as the transmissivity of fractures that connect the flow paths but do not 330 cross the boreholes. 331

332 3. Experimental Setting

333 3.1. Experimental Site

The temperature tomography experiments were carried out within a frac-334 tured rock aquifer at the test-site Stang er Brune (Ploemeur, France) (Le 335 Borgne et al., 2007). The site consists of 4 boreholes: borehole B1 (83 m336 deep), boreholes B2 and B3 (100 m deep) and borehole F22 (70 m deep). B1, 337 B2 and B3 form a triangle within a radius of 10 m and F22 is 30 m from this 338 triangle (Figure 4A). The geology of the site is characterized by a gently dip-339 ping contact between granite and overlying micaschists. This contact zone 340 intersects boreholes at the following depths: B1 at 38 m, B2 at 37 m, B3 at 341 37.5 m, and F22 at 13 m. Both hydrological and borehole data (Le Borgne et 342 al., 2007) demonstrate the presence of a shallow fracture within a mica-schist 343

formation dipping parallel to the contact zone between granite and overlying 344 micaschists and intersecting all the boreholes at the site. Moreover, B1, B2 345 and B3 boreholes are intersected by several permeable fractures within the 346 granite formation (Le Borgne et al., 2007; Dorn et al., 2012, 2013). The 347 site is located near a lake and there is a regional or watershed scale upward 348 flow at this location, resulting from hydraulic head difference between the 349 deepest confined fractures in granite and the upper mica schist. Flow mea-350 surements demonstrated that F22 borehole is not affected by vertical flow. 351 In the next section, we demonstrate that temperature measurements on the 352 site are strongly influenced by these hydrogeological conditions. 353

354 3.2. Borehole Temperature Profiles in Ambient Conditions

Temperature measurements were conducted under ambient flow condi-355 tions with a temperature logging device, the Idronaut CDT 302 Multi-Parameter 356 Probe with a tool precision of $0.005^{\circ}C$ (Figure 4C). All four wells show abrupt 357 changes in temperature gradient between 10 and 40 meters depth, the exact 358 depth depending on the borehole. Below this depth, the temperature gradi-359 ent is relatively low and variable between the different boreholes. Above this 360 depth, the temperature gradient changes to conform to the surface tempera-361 ture, which is fixed by the mean annual surface temperature equal to about 362 $T_{surf} = 12.5^{\circ}C.$ 363

The observed site-scale temperature field is typical of the one perturbed by a gently dipping structure where fluids of greater temperature than the surrounding rocks are flowing from depth to sub-surface (e.g. Ge, 1998; Saar, 2011). The corresponding flow pattern is shown in Figure 4B. For each borehole, the depths of change in gradient, F22 at 8 m, B1 at 24 m, B2 at 25

m and B3 at 36.5 m, correspond to the depths of the first shallow fracture in mica-schists, which was reported by *Le Borgne et al.* (2007). Fluid flow in this fracture advects heat and because water in the conduit is assumed well mixed it provides a constant temperature boundary condition. Consequently, this process distorts the otherwise continuous linear geothermal profile (*Saar*, 2011).

Below the sub-horizontal fracture in mica-schist, the boreholes have different temperature gradients. The highest thermal gradient $\gamma = 0.016 \ ^{\circ}C/m$ was measured in the F22 well. This borehole has no significant ambient vertical flow due to its very low permeability and so the temperature field is dominated by the upward conductive heat transfer. Thus, the F22 temperaturedepth profile may be considered representative of the temperature of the surrounding rock at the site.

While this groundwater flow in the mica-schist influences the temperature field of the whole site, the temperature gradients variations in granite seem to have much less regional influence. In boreholes B1, B2, and B3 the temperature gradients measured below 30-40 meters are typically lower than the geothermal gradient estimated from F22. This is the result of upward advective flow between flowing fractures as revealed by borehole flow logs (*Klepikova et al.*, 2011).

Furthermore, for all boreholes a slight change in temperature gradient is observed at the depth of the contact zone between granite and micaschists (see previous section), that is shown by the black line in Figure 4C. These thermal gradient variations are due to the higher thermal conductivity of granite compared to micaschists. Moreover, the B3 temperature profile in

Figure 4 shows abrupt temperature changes at 45 m and 80 m, which correspond to depths of fractures reported by *Le Borgne et al.* (2007). These anomalies are explained by the localized lateral advection of colder water within narrow fractures in granite intersecting the borehole (*Ge*, 1998). To summarize our observations, the borehole temperature distributions reflect five dominant factors:

- upward conductive heat transfer through the rocks reflected as a continuous increase of temperature with depth,
- e gently dipping groundwater flow in micaschists of warmer (deeper) origin,
- advection of heat by the vertical flow in the boreholes,
- localized lateral advective transfer of water within narrow fractures,
- variations in thermal properties of rock.

407 3.3. Temperature Tomography Experiments

After measuring the ambient temperature profiles and hydraulic heads 408 in all boreholes, three successive cross-hole pumping tests were conducted 409 in B1, B2 and B3 with temperature monitoring in all boreholes. For the 410 temperature tomography study, the temperature profiles need to be measured 411 a sufficient time after pumping to ensure steady state has been reached. To 412 monitor this, a set of 7 thermistors was centered permanently within each 413 well. The number of transducers was chosen to be able to control all borehole 414 sections between the flowing fractures. To record temperature variations 415

with time for the given depths, the acquisition time of 20 s was chosen. 416 An example of temporal evolution of temperature is given in Figure 5D. 417 These data show that thermal steady state for each particular depth and 418 well was reached in 1-2 hours after switching on the pumping, depending 419 on the pumping and observation locations. The temperature variations with 420 time were not used in the subsequent analysis for this study. However, the 421 interpretation of transient data could also provide other useful information, 422 such as thermal diffusivity values. 423

Prior to starting the next pumping test the pressure and temperature 424 were allowed to recover for each experiment. The first cross-borehole pump-425 ing test took place in well B3 with a pumping rate of $Q_{B3} = 154 \pm 3$ 426 l/min. Subsequently, we conducted pumping tests in B2 well (pumping rate 427 $Q_{B2} = 136 \pm 14 \ l/min$), and then in B1 well (pumping rate $Q_{B1} = 77 \pm 2$ 428 l/min). Thus, the full data set consists of 9 hydraulic heads and 9 tem-429 perature profiles: 3 ambient profiles and 6 profiles when pumping in the 430 neighboring well. The temperature profiles were measured with a tempera-431 ture logging device (The Idronaut CDT 302 Multi-Parameter Probe). During 432 the experiment it was observed that upward temperature logs often exhibit 433 slightly higher temperatures than downward logs. In this work we consid-434 ered only downward logs, as we believe that it creates less perturbation of 435 the temperature field. The collected steady-state temperature-depth profile 436 are shown in Figure 5, and these clearly show the sensitivity of temperature 437 measurements to changes in pumping conditions. 438

439 4. Results

In this section, we present results of the application of the inverse modelling framework to data from Stang er Brune field site. We firstly infer the location and number of flowing fractures intersecting the boreholes by applying changepoint modelling to temperature profiles. Then, we assess inter-borehole connections properties by inverting the temperature tomography data set. Finally, we discuss the corresponding uncertainty estimates.

446 4.1. Permeable Fracture Identification at Borehole Scale

In order to detect flowing fractures intersecting the boreholes, we ap-447 ply changepoint modelling e.g. (Gallagher et al., 2011) to temperature pro-448 files under ambient and single-borehole pumping flow conditions. Figure 6 449 presents ambient (A) and pumping (B) temperature profiles (with a pumping 450 rate Q = 20 l/min) measured in B1 borehole, the inferred changepoint struc-451 tures (red line) and probability distributions on the changepoint locations for 452 both flow conditions. These change point structures were determined assum-453 ing that the noise level for these temperature data equal to the ± 0.005 °C, 454 that correspond to the precision of the tool. Locations of the changepoints 455 inferred from the temperature profile under ambient flow conditions are the 456 following: z = 24 and 38 m. They correspond to the depths of the first shal-457 low fracture in mica-schists and the depth of the contact zone between granite 458 and mica-schists. As discussed in the section 3.2, the contrast in gradient 459 at the depth of the first shallow fracture in mica-schists is due to constant 460 temperature boundary condition, provided by this fracture. The change in 461 gradient at 38 m in B1 is due to the contrast in thermal conductivity of the 462

⁴⁶³ surrounding rocks. This example demonstrates that analysis of temperature ⁴⁶⁴ profiles under ambient conditions can reveal changes in temperature gradient ⁴⁶⁵ that are not related to flow in the borehole itself (e.g. contrast in thermal ⁴⁶⁶ properties of rock, low transmissive fractures carrying flow of contrast tem-⁴⁶⁷ perature).

The locations of the most probable changepoints inferred from the tem-468 perature profile under pumping conditions are the following: z = 24, 50.9, 469 60.9 and 78.7 m. They correspond well to fracture locations in B1, identified 470 previously by flowmeter tests (*Le Borgne et al.*, 2007) and ground-penetrating 471 radar (Dorn et al., 2012). The increase in the number of inferred change-472 points for the pumping conditions means that the sensitivity of the method 473 could be improved by increasing the pumping rate. However, as discussed in 474 Klepikova et al. (2011) there is a limited range of flow velocities for which 475 changes in flow produces measurable changes in the thermal gradient. Thus, 476 for too large flow velocities the temperature anomaly propagates too fast to 477 allow for measurable loss of heat to the rock formation. For too small flow 478 velocities, the temperature anomaly equilibrates quickly with the surround-479 ing rock temperature. In practice, the estimated temperature changes in a 480 given borehole section between two flowing fractures should be larger than 481 the measurement error. For our experimental conditions, we found that the 482 value of $Q = 20 \ l/min$ is optimal as further increasing the pumping rate 483 implies that the temperature profile would appear to be completely straight. 484 After applying the changepoint modelling method to other boreholes, the 485 depths of the inferred most probable changepoints are z = 24, 56 and 79 486 in B2 borehole and z = 35, 45 and 80 in B3 borehole. These depths are 487

also consistent with fractures that were identified as being transmissive by
single-borehole flowmeter tests (*Le Borgne et al.*, 2007), demonstrating the
potential of changepoint modelling in the automatic detection of the main
transmissive fractures from temperature profiles.

492 4.2. Inverse Modeling of Borehole Temperature Profiles for Flow Estimation

Having detected the flowing fractures, we simulate flow and temperature 493 advection for each borehole from the first bottom transmissive fracture up 494 to the shallowest transmissive fracture. The rock temperature at the outer 495 boundary of the model borehole is inferred from the temperature profile mea-496 sured in F22 as it is not affected by borehole flow. The thermal properties 497 of the rock matrix were chosen to be equal to the mean thermal properties 498 measured in laboratory on samples from B1 borehole. Note, that we tested 490 in our numerical model what could be the consequence of uncertainties about 500 thermal conductivity and we found that the resulting uncertainty about ve-501 locity estimation remains within a few percent. Thus, the granite thermal 502 conductivity is given by $k_{Rock} = 3.31 W/m^{\circ}C$, the heat capacity of the gran-503 ite is given by $C_{Rock} = 738 J/kg^{\circ}C$. The values for water properties are given 504 by $k_{Fluid} = 0.59 \ W/m^{\circ}C$ and $C_{Fluid} = 4189 \ J/kg^{\circ}C$ respectively (Incropera 505 and DeWitt, 1996). 506

A typical example of the objective function versus the vertical borehole flow velocity is presented in Figure 7. In this figure the optimal flow velocity (v_{opt}) is presented for the part of temperature profile measured in B1 borehole (over the depth range 60.9 - 78.7 m) while pumping in B2. In order to quantify the uncertainty on this flow velocity, we determine the range of possible flow velocities (v_{min}, v_{max}) for which the objective function is less than one

and thus the difference between the simulated and measured temperature is 513 less than the relative accuracy of the probe (Equation 6). The objective func-514 tion is found to be most sensitive for $v = 5 \cdot 10^{-4} - 2 \cdot 10^{-3} m/s$ flow velocity 515 range. For larger velocities the temperature anomaly propagates too fast to 516 allow for significant temperature change by heat loss to the rock formation. 517 Then for flow velocities larger than $v = 2 \cdot 10^{-2} m/s$ the temperature profile 518 becomes completely straight and the objective function becomes insensitive 519 to velocity. It is difficult to affirm that we found a global minima. However, 520 for all cases considered in this study, the objective function was found to be 521 smooth and convex thus enable efficient minimization. 522

The inversion results show that vertical borehole flow occurs in all bore-523 holes under ambient conditions. In order to check the accuracy of the es-524 timated flow profiles, we measured flow profiles directly with heat-pulse 525 flowmeter for some hydrodynamic conditions (ambient and during pump-526 ing in B2 borehole). The heat pulse flowmeter can measure flow velocities as 527 small as 0.5 L/min (*Paillet*, 2004). The uncertainty on the velocity values 528 obtained from temperature profiles varies between 0.1 and 0.5 L/min de-529 pending on the length of the borehole flowing sections and the flow velocity. 530 The flow velocities obtained from temperature measurements are compared 531 in Figure 8 to flow measured directly with a flowmeter under the same hy-532 drodynamic conditions. It appears that the method allows the reliable esti-533 mation of flow velocities for a large range of flow, although the model slightly 534 underestimates flow for larger flow velocities. A possible reason for this may 535 be that the upper limit of the applicability of the model was reached for this 536 particular borehole section. Overall, however, the inversion of all measured 537

temperature profiles provides a complete and continuous flow velocity dataset for flow tomography.

540 4.3. Site Scale Flow Inverse Modelling

We now apply the flow tomography framework in order to estimate the 541 transmissivities of hydraulically active fractures between and around each 542 borehole pair. To model flow between boreholes, the fracture network geom-543 etry has been simplified as described in Section 2.3 and we couple the forward 544 model with the inverse algorithm. The partial differential equation (Equa-545 tion 4) was solved with the finite element code Comsol Multiphysics 4.2a 546 with a fine tetrahedral meshing. A set of 20 starting transmissivity models 547 is generated for each boreholes pair to search for a minimum of the objective 548 functions. Note that the computation time for one direct simulation is about 549 2 minutes, while the solution converges generally after several hundred iter-550 ations. Thus, the number of starting points was limited by computing time 551 for these modelling runs. For each borehole pair several solutions were found 552 to satisfy the convergence criteria. As all acceptable solutions were found 553 to be similar (except few cases discussed below), we consider only the 'best' 554 solution providing the minimum of the objective function. Nevertheless, we 555 accept the possibility that some solutions may correspond to local minima of 556 the objective function. This can be addressed to some extent by increasing 557 the number of the starting models if desired. 558

The inverted parameter estimates are shown in Figures 9, 10 and 11 and synthesized in Table 1. Our results show that fracture transmissivities at the site range from 10^{-6} to $2 \cdot 10^{-3} m^2/s$, which is in general agreement with other studies at the same site (*Le Borgne et al.*, 2007; *Dorn et al.*, 2012, 2013). The

obtained solution yields the best fit to measured borehole drawdowns and the flow tomography data inverted from temperature profiles. The comparison of flow tomography data, including drawdowns s and variations of vertical borehole flow velocities during cross-borehole pumping Δv in observation boreholes, and inversion results is given in Table 2. This shows that the predicted and measured flow and drawdowns values are generally in good agreement for the cross-borehole tests.

To explain qualitatively the results, we discuss the relationship between 570 the inferred connectivity patterns (transmissivities of different sections of the 571 vertical fracture T_i) and variations of vertical borehole flow velocities during 572 cross-borehole pumping. The results for the B1-B2 borehole pair (Figure 9, 573 Table 1) demonstrate that the most transmissive fracture connection is the 574 one at a depth of 50 m that connect B1-3 and B2-2 fractures (log $T_3 = -2.8$). 575 In contrast, the deep fractures, B1-4 and B2-4, are found to be poorly con-576 nected (log $T_5 = -5.8$). These results can be understood with reference to 577 Table 2, where flow tomography data (drawdowns s and variations of vertical 578 borehole flow velocities Δv during cross-borehole pumping tests in observa-579 tion boreholes) are presented. For the B1-B2 borehole pair, we found an 580 increase of upward flow for all sections of both boreholes. Flow in the ob-581 servation well is directly towards the fracture that transmits most drawdown 582 from the pumping well. Thus, this explains the strong connection found 583 for B1-3 and B2-2 fractures and it implies that overall transmissivities of 584 fractures connecting the B1-B2 borehole pair should decrease with depth. 585 Similarly, for the B1-B3 and B2-B3 borehole pairs, an increase in upward 586 flow in both boreholes during cross-borehole pumping tests (Table 2) implies 587

⁵⁸⁸ good fracture connections for the shallow fracture and less connectivity of⁵⁸⁹ deep fractures.

For the fracture connection discussed above, the transmissivities T_i were 590 similar for all solution. However, for few cases the parameter estimations 591 were found to be uncertain. In order to explain this we refer to the sensi-592 tivity analysis for flow tomography approach conducted in our recent study 593 (Klepikova et al., 2013). This sensitivity analysis demonstrates that for small 594 borehole flows, similar velocities can be produced by different combinations 595 of fracture transmissivities, implying that the uncertainty about parameter 596 estimations increases as borehole flow decreases. Thus, large flow velocities 597 in deep borehole sections (Table 2) provide a strong constraint for deep frac-598 ture connections for the B1-B2 and B1-B3 borehole pairs. For instance, for 599 the B1-B2 borehole pair, to maximize the difference in hydraulic heads draw-600 ing these velocities, the transmissivity of the T_3 fracture connection should 601 be maximized, while the transmissivity of the T_4 fracture connection should 602 be minimized. In contrast, small flow velocities in shallow borehole sections 603 implies that the estimates of the parameters T_1 and T_2 are rather uncertain. 604 For the fracture network connecting the B2-B3 borehole pair, small flow ve-605 locities in both wells (Table 2), do not provide a strong constraint for the 606 interconnection fracture transmissivities and the estimations of T_2 , T_3 and 607 T_4 vary within two orders of magnitude. 608

The most transmissive fracture connections at the site can be summarizedas follows:

- B1 B2 borehole pair is mainly connected through B1 2 and B2 2
- 612

611

• B1 - B3 borehole pair is mainly connected through the cluster that

consists of B3 - 1, B3 - 2, B1 - 1 and B1 - 2 fractures

614 615 • B2 - B3 borehole pair is mainly connected through 2 independent clusters. The first one consists of B2 - 2, B3 - 1 and B3 - 2, and the

second one consists of B2 - 4 and B3 - 3.

5. Comparison With Results From Flowmeter Tests and Ground Penetrating Radar Data

Analysis of fracture connections on this field site have been also conducted 619 by Le Borgne et al. (2007), Dorn et al. (2012) and Dorn et al. (2013). Le 620 Borgne et al. (2007) used televiewer data together with cross-borehole single 621 packer testing and cross-borehole flowmeter testing at the site to characterize 622 fracture hydraulic connections. Comparison with our results demonstrates 623 that temperature based approach provides consistent results with very few 624 exceptions. Thus, flowmeter tests and packer tests both confirm that B2 well 625 is connected to B1 and B3 wells mostly through B2-2 fracture. The main 626 difference concerns to the connection of B2-4 fracture zone to B1 borehole. 627 which we find here to be poorly connected (Figure 9). Le Borgne et al. (2007) 628 found that, although the main head variation during single packer tests is 629 occurring in the B2-2 fracture zone in B2 when pumping in B1, the B2-4630 fracture zone appears also to be connected to B1. 631

Dorn et al. (2012) used tracer test data combined with single-hole groundpenetrating radar (GPR) data to characterize pattern of fractures that contribute to tracer transport in between B1 and B2 wells. The images obtained confirmed the existence of a network of connected fractures including the B2-2, B2-4 and B1-4 fractures. However, fractures that contribute to tracer

transport are not necessarily those that provide the significant contribution to flow (*Dorn et al.*, 2012). Furthermore, for some fracture patterns, our conceptual approach introduces some constraints on fracture connections. For instance, in our approach, the B2-4 fracture can not be connected to any other fracture without being connected to the B1-4 fracture. A possible solution to tackle the problem would be the use of more realistic fracture geometry provided through geophysical data (*Dorn et al.*, 2012).

Dorn et al. (2013) used hydraulic, tracer, televiewer and GPR reflec-644 tion data to generate stochastic 3-D discrete fracture models in the vicinity 645 of the B1 and B2 boreholes such that these fracture networks agree with 646 all available data. They also performed flow simulations on the proposed 647 discrete fracture networks in order to derive the effective transmissivity of 648 hydraulic connections between the boreholes. Their values of the effective 649 transmissivities varied in the range of $10^{-6} - 10^{-3} m^2/s$ that matches well 650 with our estimates. For the individual hydraulic connections, they found the 651 B1-4 - B2-2 fracture connection to be the most transmissive, and that B1-2 652 and B1-3 fractures are well connected to B2 borehole, which is in agreement 653 with our results in Figure 9. As expected, the fracture network geometry 654 inferred from GPR data is much more complex than the conceptualization 655 used in the present study. In particularly, we didn't include in our model 656 two fractures, intersected B2 borehole at 49 and 52 m depth (Dorn et al., 657 2013). However, as flow prediction made by our flow model are reasonnable 658 and flow contributions of these fractures are negligible, we believe that these 659 simplifications not change a lot in terms of fracture network transmissivity. 660 This point emphasize that both methods are complementary: geometry can 661

⁶⁶² be constrained from geophysical data, whereas hydraulic properties can be
 ⁶⁶³ inferred from flow tomography data.

664 6. Discussions and Conclusions

The temperature tomography approach (i.e. sequential borehole temper-665 ature logging under cross-borehole flow conditions) has been proposed here 666 as a method to characterize the connectivity and transmissivity of preferen-667 tial permeable flow paths in fractured aquifers. An inverse model framework 668 was developed to estimate log-transformed transmissivity values of hydrauli-669 cally active fractures between and around borehole pairs. We first detect the 670 main permeable fractures through inversion of borehole temperature profiles 671 under pumping conditions. Then we apply a borehole-scale flow and tem-672 perature model to produce flowmeter profiles by inversion of temperature 673 profiles. Finally we invert the obtained cross-borehole flowmeter profiles in 674 order to infer inter-borehole fracture connectivity and transmissivities. 675

The method proposed has been successfully applied to temperature tomography data obtained from a fractured rock aquifer. The results of application of the proposed approach to the Stang Er Brune experimental site (Ploemeur) can be synthesized as follows:

• A general flow pattern for the experimental site is proposed based on the analysis of borehole temperature profiles under ambient flow conditions.

683

685

680

681

682

The inversion of single-borehole flow and cross-borehole temperature data is shown to allow the detection of the main fractures at the site and to image their hydraulic properties.

686 687 • In some cases of multi-fracture connections it appears difficult to propose a simple conceptual model of flow and connectivity.

These first applications are encouraging in that, even though the fracture 688 network geometry has been simplified, the estimates of fracture connectivity 689 and hydraulic properties are generally consistent with other data sets avail-690 able on this site. In the future, tracer experiments and geophysical surveys 691 (Dorn et al., 2012) may be coupled with temperature data to assess the over-692 all fracture network geometry and its hydraulic properties. Furthermore, a 693 possible extension of this inverse approach could exploit simultaneous joint 694 inversion of multiple pumping tests with more than two boreholes to identify 695 and characterize a connected fracture cluster all over the site. 696

The temperature tomography approach proposed in this study has some 697 limitations. First, the method is not sufficiently sensitive to identify all 698 flowing fractures in a given borehole and only allows the detection of the 699 most transmissive fractures. Second, the capacity of this approach is lim-700 ited when cross-borehole pumping induces similar hydraulic head variations 701 within flow paths connecting borehole pair. In this case, the resulting ve-702 locity in the concerned section of observation borehole is close to zero and 703 uncertainty about corresponding parameter drastically increases. Third, as 704 the approach is based on indirect measurements of temperature, in order 705 to obtain detectable temperature variations, significant flow velocities are 706 required to apply successfully the methodology proposed (*Klepikova et al.*, 707 2011). Finally, it also requires the temperature to change with depth. 708

Although there are some limitations, we argue that the temperature tomography method is a promising alternative to hydraulic tomography tests

that require the use of straddle packers. In particular, the temperature to-711 mography approach was found to be clearly useful for fractured rock aquifers 712 as Ploemeur field site (Le Borgne et al., 2006, 2007). The method is also 713 likely to be applicable to field sites with significant flow velocities such as 714 karst aquifers (e.g. Chatelier et al., 2011). Another interesting question of 715 investigation is whether the method proposed could be used to characterize 716 alluvial aquifers. However, getting necessary information in such type of en-717 vironment will probably require more detailed temperature measurements. 718 Further work is required to answer this question. 719

720 7. Acknowledgments

This work was supported by the European Marie Curie network IMVUL (Grant Agreement 212298), by the National Research Observatory H+, by the European Interreg IV project CLIMAWAT, and by the ANR project CRITEX, ANR-11-EQPX-0011 "Investissements d'avenir".

725 **References**

- Anderson, M. P. (2005), Heat as a ground water tracer, *Ground Water*, 43(6),
 951–968.
- Barton, C. A. and Zoback, M. D. and Moos, D. (1995), Fluid flow along
 potentially active faults in crystalline rock, *Geology*, 23(8).
- ⁷³⁰ Barton, C. A. and M. D. Zoback (1992), Self-Similar Distribution and Prop⁷³¹ erties of Macroscopic Fractures at Depth in Crystalline Rock in the Cajon

- Pass Scientific Drill Hole, Journal of Geophysical Research, 97(B4), 5181–
 5200.
- Bense, V. F., Person, M. A., Chaudhary, K., You, Y., Cremer, N., and S.
 Simon (2008), Thermal anomalies indicate preferential flow along faults
 in unconsolidated sedimentary aquifers, *Geophysical Research Letters*,
 35(24), L24406, doi:10.1029/2008GL036017.
- Berg, S.J., and W.A. Illman (2013), Field Study of Subsurface Heterogeneity
 with Steady-State Hydraulic Tomography, *Ground Water*, 51(1), 29–40.
- Berkowitz B. (2002), Characterizing flow and transport in fractured geological media: A review, Advances in Water Resources, 25, 861–884.
- Bidaux, P., and C. Drogue (1993), Calculation of low-range flow velocities
 in fractured carbonate media from borehole hydrochemical logging data
 comparison with thermometric results, *Ground Water*, 31(1), 19–26.
- Brauchler, R., R. Liedl and P. Dietrich (2003), A travel time based hydraulic tomographic approach, *Water Resource Research*, 39(12), 1370,
 doi10.1029/2003WR002262.
- Bredehoeft, J. H., and I. S. Papadopulos (1965), Rates of vertical groundwater movement estimated from the Earth's thermal profile, *Water Resource Research*, 1, 325–328.
- ⁷⁵¹ Chatelier, M., S. Ruelleu, O. Bour, G. Porel, and F. Delay (2011), Combined
 ⁷⁵² fluid temperature and flow logging for the characterization of hydraulic
 ⁷⁵³ structure in a fractured karst aquifer, *Journal of Hydrology*, 400, 377-386.

Deming D. (1993), Regional permeability estimates from investigations of 754 coupled heat and groundwater flow, North Slope of Alaska, Journal of 755 Geophysical Research, 98, 16271–16286. 756

Dorn C., N. Linde, T. Le Borgne, O. Bour, and M. Klepikova (2012), In-757 ferring transport characteristics in a fractured rock aquifer by combining 758 single-hole GPR reflection monitoring and tracer test data, Water Resource 759 Research, 48, W11521, doi10.1029/2011WR011739.

760

- Dorn C., N. Linde, T. Le Borgne, O. Bour, and J.-R. de Dreuzy 761 (2013), Conditioning of stochastic 3-D fracture networks to hydrolog-762 ical and geophysical data, Advances in Water Resources, 62, 79-89, 763 doi10.1016/j.advwatres.2013.10.005. 764
- Elci, A., Molz, F. J. and Waldrop, W. R. (2001), Implications of Observed 765 and Simulated Ambient Flow in Monitoring Wells, Ground Water, 39, 766 853862. doi10.1111/j.1745-6584.2001.tb02473.x. 767
- Ferguson G. (2006), Perturbation of ground surface temperature reconstruc-768 tions by groundwater flow, Geophysical Research Letters, 33, L13708, 769 doi10.1029/2006GL026634. 770
- Flynn T. (1985), Water temperature as a groundwater tracer in fractured 771 rock, M.S. thesis, Univ. of Arizona, Tucson. 772
- Freifeld, B. M., S. Finsterle, T. C. Onstott, P. Toole, and L. M. Pratt 773 (2008), Ground surface temperature reconstructions: Using in situ es-774 timates for thermal conductivity acquired with a fiber-optic distributed

thermal perturbation sensor, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 35, L14309,
doi10.1029/2008GL034762.

Gallagher, K., Bodin, T., Sambridge, M., Weiss, D., Kylander, M., Large,
D. (2011), Inference of abrupt changes in noisy geochemical records using
transdimensional changepoint models, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 311(1), 182–194, doi10.1016/j.epsl.2011.09.015.

- Garibaldi, C., Guillou-Frottier, L., Lardeaux, J. M., Bonte, D., Lopez, S.,
 Bouchot, V. and Ledru, P. (2010), Thermal anomalies and geological structures in the Provence basin: Implications for hydrothermal circulations at
 depth, Bulletin de la Société Géologique de France, 181(4), 363-376.
- Ge, S. M. (1998), Estimation of groundwater velocity in localized fracture
 zones from well temperature profiles, *Journal of Volcanology and Geother- mal Research*, 84(1-2), 93-101.
- Genter, A., Castaing, C., Dezayes, C., Tenzer, H., Traineau, H., villemin, T.
 (1997), Comparative analysis of direct (core) and indirect (borehole imaging tools) collection of fracture data in the Hot Dry rock soultz reservoir
 (France), J. Geophys. Res., 102(B7), 1541915431.
- Hess, A. E. (1986), Identifying hydraulically conductive fractures with a slow
 velocity borehole flowmeter, *Canadian Geotechnical Journal*, 23, 69–78.
- ⁷⁹⁵ Illman, W. A.,X. Liu,S. Takeuchi, T.-C. J. Yeh, K. Ando, and H. Sae⁷⁹⁶ gusa (2009), Hydraulic tomography in fractured granite: Mizunami Un⁷⁹⁷ derground Research site, Japan, *Water Resource Research*, 45, W01406,
 ⁷⁹⁸ doi10.1029/2007WR006715.

- Incropera and DeWitt (1996), Fundamentals of heat and mass transfer, 4th
 ed., New York: Wiley.
- Klepikova, M. V., T. Le Borgne., O. Bour, P. Davy (2011), A methodology for
 using temperature-depth profiles under ambient, single and cross-borehole
 pumping conditions to estimate fracture hydraulic properties, *Journal of*
- ⁸⁰⁴ *Hydrology*, 407(1-4), 145–152, doi10.1016/j.jhydrol.2011.07.018.
- Klepikova, M. V., T. Le Borgne., O. Bour, J.-R. de Dreuzy, Inverse modelling of flow tomography experiments in fractured media, *Water Resource Research*, 49(11), 7255–7265, doi10.1002/2013WR013722.
- Keys, W. S. (1979), Borehole geophysics in igneous and metamorphic rocks,
 Trans. SPWLA Annual Logging Syrup., 20th, 407, 1-26.
- Lagarias, J.C., J. A. Reeds, M. H. Wright, and P. E. Wright (1998), Convergence Properties of the Nelder-Mead Simplex Method in Low Dimensions, *SIAM Journal of Optimization*, 9(1), 112–147.
- Leaf, A. T., D. J. Hart, J. M. Bahr (2012), Active thermal tracer tests for improved hydrostratigraphic characterization, *Ground Water*, 50(5), doi10.1111/j.1745-6584.2012.00913.x.
- Jolivet, J., G. Bienfait, J. L. Vigneresse, and M. Cuney (1988), Heat flow and heat production in Brittany (Western France), *Tectonophysics*, 159, 61-72.
- Le Borgne, T., Paillet, F.L., Bour, O., Caudal, J.-P. (2006), Cross-borehole

- flowmeter tests for transient heads in heterogeneous aquifers, *Ground Water*, 44, doi10.1111/j.1745-6584.2005.00150.x.
- Le Borgne, T., O. Bour, M.S. Riley, P. Gouze, P.A. Pezard, A. Belghoul,
- G. Lods, R. Le Provost, R. B. Gresswell, P. A. Ellis, E. Isakov, and B. J.
- Last (2007), Comparison of alternative methodologies for identifying and
- characterizing preferential flow paths in heterogeneous aquifers, *Journal of*
- Hydrology, 345(3-4), 134-148, doi 10.1016/j.jhydro 1.2007.07.007.
- Mwenifumbo, C. J. (1993), Temperature logging in mineral exploration,
 Journal of Applied Geophysics, 30, 297–313.
- Newhouse, M. W., J. A. Izbicki and G. A. Smith (2005), TComparison of
 velocity-log data collected using impeller and electromagnetic flowmeters,
- ⁸³¹ Ground Water, 43, 434-438.
- Paillet, F. L. (1998), Flow modeling and permeability estimation using borehole flow logs in heterogeneous fractured formations, *Water Resource Research*, 34 (5), 997–1010.
- Paillet, F. L. (2000), A field technique for estimating aquifer parameters
 using flow log data, *Ground Water*, 38(4), 510–521.
- Paillet, F. L. (2004), Borehole flowmeter applications in irregular and largediameter boreholes, *Journal of Applied Geophysics*, 55, 39–59.
- Paillet, F. L., J. H. Williams, J. Urik, J. Lukes, M. Kobr and S. Mares
 (2012), Cross-borehole flow analysis to characterize fracture connections

- in the Melechov Granite, Bohemian-Moravian Highland, Czech Republic,
 Hydrogeology Journal, 20(1), 143–154, doi10.1007/s10040-011-0787-1.
- Pehme, P.E., B.L. Parker, J.A. Cherry, and J.P. Greenhouse (2010), Improved resolution of ambient flow through fractured rock with temperature logs, *Ground Water*, 48(2), 191-205.
- Pehme, P.E., B.L. Parker, J.A. Cherry, J.W. Molson and J.P. Greenhouse (2013), Enhanced detection of hydraulically active fractures by temperature profiling in lined heated bedrock boreholes, *Journal of Hydrology*, 48(0), 1–15.
- Perry, H. K. C., C. Jaupart, J.-C. Mareschal, and G. Bienfait (2006), Crustal
 heat production in the Superior Province, Canadian Shield, and in North
 America inferred from heat flow data, J. Geophys. Res., 111, B04401,
 doi10.1029/2005JB003893.
- Quinn, P.M., J.A. Cherry, B.L. Parker (2011), Quantification of non-Darcian
 flow observed during packer testing in fractured rock, *Water Resource Resource*, 47(9), W09533, doi10.1029/2010WR009681.
- Read, T., O. Bour, V. F. Bense, T. Le Borgne, P. Goderniaux, M. Klepikova,
 R. Hochreutener, N. Lavenant and V. Boschero (2013), Characterizing
 groundwater flow and heat transport in fractured rock using fiber-optic distributed temperature sensing, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 40(10), 2055–
 2059, doi10.1002/grl.50397.

Reiter, M. (2001), Using precision temperature logs to estimate horizon-

- tal and vertical groundwater flow components, *Water Resource Research*, 37(3), 663–674.
- Saar, M. O. (2011), Review: Geothermal heat as a tracer of large-scale
 groundwater flow and as a means to determine permeability field, *Hy- drogeology Journal*, 19, 31–52.
- Sawdey, J.R., and A.S. Reeve (2012), Automated inverse computer modeling of borehole flow data in heterogeneous aquifers, *Computers and Geosciences*, 46, 219–228.
- Silliman, S. and Robinson, R. (1989), Identifying Fracture Interconnections
 Between Boreholes Using Natural Temperature Profiling: I. Conceptual
 Basis, Ground Water, 27, 393402, doi10.1111/j.1745-6584.1989.tb00463.x.
- Shapiro, A. M. and Hsieh, P. A.(1998), How good are estimates of transmissivity from slug tests in fractured rock?, *Ground Water*, 36, 37–48.
- Sharmeen, R., W. A. Illman, S. J. Berg, T.-C. J. Yeh, Y.-J. Park, E. A. Sudicky, and K. Ando (2012), Transient hydraulic tomography in a fractured
 dolostone: Laboratory rock block experiments, *Water Resource Resource*,
 48, W10532, doi10.1029/2012WR012216.
- Tarantola, A. (2004), Inverse Problem Theory and Model Parameter Estimation, SIAM.
- Wagner, V., Li, T., Bayer, P. and Leven, C., Dietrich, P. and Blum, P. (2013), Thermal tracer testing in a sedimentary aquifer: field experiment

- (Lauswiesen, Germany) and numerical simulation, *Hydrogeology Journal*,
 doi10.1007/s10040-013-1059-z.
- Williams, G. R., G. Brown, W. Hawthorne, A. H. Hartog and P. C. Waite
- (2000), Distributed temperature sensing (DTS) to characterize the per-
- formance of producing oil wells, Proc. SPIE, Industrial Sensing Systems,
- doihttp://dx.doi.org/10.1117/12.411726.
- ⁸⁹⁰ Yeh T. C. Jim and S. Liu (2000), Hydraulic tomography: Development of a
- new aquifer test method, *Water Resources Research*, 36(8), 2095–2105.



Figure 1: Illustration of a typical groundwater flow and temperature fields for a pair of boreholes connected by one main flow path and intersected by one disconnected fracture each borehole under ambient (A) and pumping (B) flow conditions. The velocity field and temperature field are computed using 2D model.



Figure 2: Illustration of the temperature tomography field method conducted in between two boreholes connected by one fracture and intersected by two disconnected fractures (a). Temperature profiles measured under ambient and pumping flow conditions are shown by blue and red correspondingly. Illustration of processing steps of an inverse framework for interpretation of such a data set: (b) automatic fracture detection by applying changepoint modelling; (c) inversion of temperature profiles under ambient, single and cross-borehole flow conditions to derive flow profiles; (d) estimation of fracture hydraulic properties and connectivity between and around a borehole pair by applying flow tomography modelling.



Figure 3: Illustration of the flow and temperature propagation simulation in a borehole. Borehole temperature profile with inferred fracture positions (A) and corresponding heat transfer model boundary conditions (B). We consider the heat diffusion and advection of heat with a constant vertical laminar flow in the borehole and the heat diffusion in the surrounding rock matrix. For each borehole section we impose the borehole flow as the sum of all fractures inflows and outflows (Q_{fr}) below the modeled section (shown by red).



Figure 4: A. Location of the Stang-er-Brune study site, boreholes array configuration and geology of the site. B. Conceptual hydrothermal setting: temperature profile affected by groundwater flow of warmer origin, by localized flow of warmer or cooler origin in narrow fractures and by vertical flow in the borehole itself. C. Temperature profiles measured at the site under the ambient flow conditions.



Figure 5: Temperature tomography experiment. Steady-state temperature profiles measured in B1 well when pumping in B2 and B3 wells (a). Steady-state temperature profiles measured in B2 well when pumping in B1 and B3 wells (b). Steady-state temperature profiles measured in B3 well when pumping in B1 and B2 wells (c). Example of temporal evolution of temperature in B2 at 57 m depth (d).



Figure 6: Inferred changepoint models for the temperature profiles measured in B1 borehole under ambient (A) and pumping (B) flow conditions, while pumping at the top of B1 with a pumping rate $Q = 20 \ l/min$. The solid red line is the inferred function (relative to the down axis), and the solid black line represents the probability of a changepoint (relative to the upper axis). The error bars are drawn using the mean value of the noise variances for each data set (relative to the down axis). The most probable inferred numbers of changepoints are 2 and 4 respectively.



Figure 7: Example of the objective function versus the vertical borehole flow velocity. The minima of the objective function corresponds to the optimal flow velocity (v_{opt}) , and all the solutions in the range (v_{min}, v_{max}) are acceptable.



Figure 8: Comparison between flowmeter measurements and velocity values inverted from temperature measurements. Blue markers correspond to ambient flow conditions, while red markers correspond to cross-borehole pumping conditions. Note, that this plot also demonstrates the variability of the flow measurements inside borehole sections due to the tool error and/or variations in borehole diameter.

G



Figure 9: Inferred fracture transmissivities (T) and connectivities between and around B1-B2 borehole pair. Observation well drawdowns during cross-borehole pumping s are shown by blue lines. Variations of vertical velocities during cross-borehole pumping Δv in observation boreholes are shown by green arrows.

Y CC



Figure 10: Inferred fracture transmissivities (T) and connectivities between and around B3-B1 borehole pair. Observation well drawdowns during cross-borehole pumping s are shown by blue lines. Variations of vertical velocities during cross-borehole pumping Δv in observation boreholes are shown by green arrows.

XC



Figure 11: Inferred fracture transmissivities (T) and connectivities between and around B2-B3 borehole pair. Observation well drawdowns during cross-borehole pumping s are shown by blue lines. Variations of vertical velocities during cross-borehole pumping Δv in observation boreholes are shown by green arrows.

ACC

Table 1: Inferred fracture transmissivities. We utilized ambient and steady pumping single-borehole flow profiles and drawdowns in order to infer local fracture transmissivities and cross-borehole flow profiles and drawdowns were used for inversion of connected fracture transmissivities.

| | | Data used for in | | |
|--|-------|-----------------------------|------------|---------------------|
| Scale | Well | Data used for in- | Fracture | $T, m^2/s$ |
| | | version | | |
| Transmissivities of the main fractures in the near field | B1 | | T_{B1-1} | $2 \cdot 10^{-6}$ |
| | | 1 drawdown, 3 | T_{B1-2} | $4 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | velocities | T_{B1-3} | $1.3 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | | T_{B1-4} | $1.6 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | B2 | 1 drawdowns, 2 | T_{B2-1} | $2 \cdot 10^{-6}$ |
| | | velocities | T_{B2-2} | $8 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | | | T_{B2-4} | $5 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | B3 | 1 drawdowns, 2 | T_{B3-1} | $8 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | | velocities | T_{B3-2} | $1.3 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | | T_{B3-3} | $1.6 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| Transmissivities of the main connected fractures | B1-B2 | | T_1 | $1.3 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | 2 drawdowns 5 | T_2 | $8 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | | T_3 | $1.6 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | velocities | T_4 | $1.3 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | | T_5 | $1.6 \cdot 10^{-6}$ |
| | B1-B3 | | T_1 | $3.2 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | | | T_2 | $1 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | $2~\mathrm{drawdowns},5$ | T_3 | $3.2 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |
| | | velocities | T_4 | $5 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | | | T_5 | $1 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | | T_6 | $2.5 \cdot 10^{-6}$ |
| | B2-B3 | 2 drawdown, 4 velocities | T_1 | $1 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | | T_2 | $1 \cdot 10^{-3}$ |
| | | | T_3 | $6.3 \cdot 10^{-4}$ |
| | | | T_4 | $4 \cdot 10^{-6}$ |
| | | 50 | T_5 | $3.2 \cdot 10^{-5}$ |

Table 2: Comparison of flow tomography data, inverted from temperature measurements, with numerical solutions that best matches the data. Flow tomography data include drawdowns s and variations of vertical borehole flow velocities Δv during cross-borehole pumping in observation boreholes. The values of fracture transmissivities that yield the best match to the data are presented in Figure 9 for B1-B2 borehole pair, in Figure 10 for B1-B3 borehole pair and in Figure 11 for B2-B3 borehole pair. The corresponding data errors are $\sigma_v = 1 \ mm/s$ and $\sigma_s = 2 \ cm$ for flow and drawdown respectively.

| Borehole | Observation | Flow tomogra- | Best match to OF | |
|----------|------------------------|---------------|------------------|-------|
| pair | Observation | phy data | the data | value |
| | s_{B1}, cm | 34 | 29 | |
| | s_{B2}, cm | 15 | 15 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B1}, mm/s$ | 0 | 0 | |
| B1-B2 | $\Delta v_{2B1}, mm/s$ | 1 | 1 | 3.7 |
| | $\Delta v_{3B1}, mm/s$ | 3 | 1.3 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B2}, mm/s$ | 1.1 | 0.5 | |
| | $\Delta v_{2B2}, mm/s$ | 1.1 | 1.3 | |
| | s_{B1}, cm | 19 | 16 | |
| | s_{B3}, cm | 2 | 7 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B1}, mm/s$ | 1.4 | 0 | |
| B1-B3 | $\Delta v_{2B1}, mm/s$ | 1.4 | 0 | 6.35 |
| | $\Delta v_{3B1}, mm/s$ | 1.4 | 0.5 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B3}, mm/s$ | 2.8 | 0.5 | |
| | $\Delta v_{2B3}, mm/s$ | 2.8 | 3.4 | |
| | s_{B2}, cm | 14 | 14.9 | |
| B2-B3 | s_{B3}, cm | 18 | 16 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B2}, mm/s$ | -0.8 | 0 | 1.05 |
| | $\Delta v_{2B2}, mm/s$ | 1.4 | 1 | |
| | $\Delta v_{1B3}, mm/s$ | 0 | -1 | |
| | $\Delta v_{2B3}, mm/s$ | 0 | 0 | |

Highlights

- Temperature tomography is proposed as a new method for characterizing fractured media
- We propose an inverse multi-step framework to interpret borehole temperature profiles
- We automatically detect permeable fractures from borehole temperature profiles
- We produce flow profiles by inversion of temperature profiles
- We inverse flow profiles to infer fracture transmissivities and connectivity