

## Electrical properties of tholins and derived constraints on the Huygens landing site composition at the surface of Titan

Anthony Lethuillier, Alice Le Gall, Michel Hamelin, Sylvain Caujolle-Bert, Francis Schreiber, Nathalie Carrasco, Guy Cernogora, Cyril Szopa, Yann Brouet, Fernando Simões, et al.

## ▶ To cite this version:

Anthony Lethuillier, Alice Le Gall, Michel Hamelin, Sylvain Caujolle-Bert, Francis Schreiber, et al.. Electrical properties of tholins and derived constraints on the Huygens landing site composition at the surface of Titan. Journal of Geophysical Research. Planets, 2018, 123 (4), pp.807-822. 10.1002/2017JE005416. insu-01721981

## HAL Id: insu-01721981 https://insu.hal.science/insu-01721981

Submitted on 29 Jun 2018

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

## Electrical properties of tholins and derived constraints on the Huygens landing site composition at the surface of Titan

# A. Lethuillier<sup>1</sup>, A. Le Gall<sup>1</sup>, M. Hamelin<sup>2</sup>, S. Caujolle-Bert<sup>1</sup>, F. Schreiber<sup>1</sup>, N. Carrasco<sup>1</sup>, G. Cernogora<sup>1</sup>, C. Szopa<sup>1</sup>, Y. Brouet<sup>3</sup>, F. Simoes<sup>4</sup>, J.J. Correia<sup>5</sup>, G. Ruffié<sup>6</sup>

#### Key Points:

12	•	The complex permittivity of tholins was measured in laboratory at low frequencies
13		and low temperatures
14	•	By comparison with measurements from Cassini/Huygens, constraints on the com-
15		position of the Huygens Landing Site are derived
16	•	There is evidence for the presence of a conductive superficial layer at the Huygens
17		Landing Site

Corresponding author: Anthony Lethuillier, anthony.lethuillier@latmos.ipsl.fr

#### 18 Abstract

In 2005, the complex permittivity of the surface of Saturn's moon Titan was measured 19 by the PWA-MIP/HASI (Permittivity Wave Altimetry-Mutual Impedance Probe/Huygens 20 Atmospheric Structure Instrument) experiment on board the Huygens probe. The analy-21 sis of these measurements was recently refined but could not be interpreted in terms of 22 composition due to the lack of knowledge on the low-frequency/low-temperature electrical 23 properties of Titan's organic material, a likely key ingredient of the surface composition. In order to fill that gap, we developed a dedicated measurement bench and investigated 25 the complex permittivity of analogs of Titan's organic aerosols called "tholins". These 26 laboratory measurements, together with those performed in the microwave domain, are 27 then used to derive constraints on the composition of Titan's first meter below the sur-28 face based on both the PWA-MIP/HASI and the Cassini Radar observations. Assuming a 29 ternary mixture of water-ice, tholin-like dust and pores (filled or not with liquid methane), 30 we find that at least 10% of water ice and 15% of porosity are required to explain ob-31 servations. On the other hand, there should be at most 50-60% of organic dust. PWA-32 MIP/HASI measurements also suggest the presence of a thin conductive superficial layer 33 at the Huygens landing site. Using accurate numerical simulations, we put constraints on 34 the electrical conductivity of this layer as a function of its thickness (e.g., in the range 7-35 40 nS/m for a 7-mm thick layer). Potential candidates for the composition of this layer are 36 discussed. 37

#### 38 1 Introduction

On January 14, 2005, the Huygens probe [Lebreton and Matson, 2004], part of 39 the Cassini/Huygens mission (NASA/ESA/ASI), landed on the surface of Titan, Saturn's 40 biggest moon [Lebreton et al., 2005]. After two hours and a half of descent, the probe 41 touched a solid and possibly wet ground [Zarnecki et al., 2005; Atkinson et al., 2010] at a 42 latitude of 10.3 °S and a longitude of 192.4°W [Karkoschka et al., 2007]. While the mea-43 surements performed by the instruments on board Huygens cannot be regarded as repre-44 sentative of the entire surface of Titan, they do provide an important ground truth for the 45 understanding of the observations of the Cassini orbiter or Earth-based telescopes. 46

Among the instruments on board the Huygens probe, a Mutual Impedance Probe 47 (MIP), called PWA-MIP/HASI (Permittivity Wave Altimetry-Mutual Impedance Probe/Huygens 48 Atmospheric Structure Instrument), measured for the first time the low-frequency (namely 49 at 45, 90 and 360 Hz) electrical properties (i.e., the dielectric constant and electrical con-50 ductivity) of the first meter of Titan's surface [Fulchignoni et al., 2005]. Hamelin et al. [2016] recently refined the analysis of the PWA-MIP/HASI observations, accounting for 52 new insights on the final resting position of the Huygens capsule [Schröder et al., 2012]. 53 They inferred a dielectric constant of  $2.5 \pm 0.3$  and a conductivity of  $1.2 \pm 0.6$  nS/m at 45 54 Hz, values which are in agreement with previously published results but with much more 55 reliable error bars. Following Grard et al. [2006], Hamelin et al. [2016] also reported that 56 a sudden change in the electrical properties of the ground, namely a drop of its electri-57 cal conductivity, was recorded about 11 min after the Huygens landing. Several scenarios have been advanced to explain this event but more information on the electrical proper-59 ties of materials relevant to Titan's surface at PWA-MIP/HASI frequencies are required 60 to better understand PWA-MIP/HASI results in terms of near-surface composition and to 61 conclude on the most plausible scenario for the observed sudden change in conductivity. 62

Prior to the Cassini mission, the composition of Titan's surface was thought to be that of its bulk crust i.e., dominated by water ice [*Tobie et al.*, 2005]. This was supported by the detection of water ice by *Griffith et al.* [2003] from telescope infrared spectroscopy measurements. However, since then, Cassini-Huygens observations have shown that water ice is only exposed at the surface of Titan at isolated locations including interdune corridors [*Barnes et al.*, 2008; *Le Gall et al.*, 2011] and crater rims [*Janssen et al.*, 2016]. In-

stead, the surface seems to be covered by a layer of organic materials, by-products of the 69

intense photochemistry activity of Titan's atmosphere [Clark et al., 2010; Janssen et al., 70 2016].

71

The atmosphere of Titan is indeed the host of a complex photochemistry that pro-72 duces a wealth of solid organic matter (or aerosols) by dissociation (mainly by solar UV 73 rays) and recombination of the molecules N<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> [Lorenz and Mitton, 2002; Waite 74 et al., 2007]. The heaviest of these aerosols are eventually deposited onto the surface, progressively forming a thick sedimentary layer of organics. With time, surface processes 76 (e.g., aeolian/pluvial/fluvial erosion, impacts, etc...) erode this layer and/or mix organics 77 with water ice (see Lopes et al. [2010] for a review). 78

The present work aims at inferring new constraints on Titan's near-surface composi-79 tion (in particular on its water-ice/organic mixture) from the electrical measurements made 80 by PWA-MIP/HASI by comparison with laboratory measurements. While the electrical 81 properties of water ice are well known [Mattei et al., 2014], those of Titan's aerosols have 82 never been measured at low frequencies in laboratory. In this paper, we present the mea-83 surement bench that we have developed to fill this gap. Measurements were performed 84 on analogs of Titan's aerosols called "tholins" at a wide range of temperatures from room 85 temperature down to almost 90 K. Measurements made at Titan's surface temperature 86  $(93.65 \pm 0.25 \text{ K} [Fulchignoni et al., 2005])$  were then used to better understand the impli-87 cations of the PWA-MIP/HASI observations at the Huygens landing site (hereafter referred 88 as to HLS). 89

#### 2 Materials and Methods 90

91

#### 2.1 Productions of tholins

The term "tholins" was introduced by Sagan and Khare [1979] to name the "brown, 92 sometimes sticky, residue" they produced in laboratory at Cornell University by irradi-93 ating with various sources of energy a mixture of the cosmically abundant gases CH<sub>4</sub>,  $C_2H_6$ , NH<sub>3</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>O, HCHO, and H<sub>2</sub>S. The definition was later expanded to include many 95 other components produced from different mixtures and even by irradiation of ices. It now seems that tholin-like materials are present in many bodies in the Solar System: on Pluto 97 [Grundy et al., 2016], Charon [Grundy et al., 2016], comets [McDonald et al., 1996; Stern 98 et al., 2015], Triton [McDonald et al., 1994] and, of course, Titan [Sagan et al., 1993].

Several set ups have been developed to synthesize and study analogs of planetary 100 organic aerosols in laboratory (e.g., [Szopa et al., 2006] [Cable et al., 2012]). In particular, 101 the PAMPRE (French acronym for Production d'Aérosols en Microgravité par Plasma RE-102 actifs - Aerosols Production in Microgravity by Reactive Plasma, [Szopa et al., 2006]) ex-103 periment developed at LATMOS has been designed to reproduce the complex photochem-104 istry of Titan's atmosphere. PAMPRE simulates the UV photolysis of  $N_2$  and  $CH_4$  and the induced photochemistry using a Capacitively Coupled Plasma (RF-CCP) discharge. This 106 discharge is applied to a mixture of N<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> with a N<sub>2</sub>/CH<sub>4</sub> ratio in the range 90/10 107 to 99/1, consistent with Titan's atmosphere composition at different altitudes [Waite et al., 108 2007]. Inelastic electron impacts dissociate N2 and CH4 [Szopa et al., 2006] and the re-109 sulting ions, neutral atoms and radicals recombine to form solid particles [Carrasco et al., 110 2012]. The advantage of using a capacitive coupled RF plasma discharge is that the pro-111 duced particles are in levitation between the two electrodes due to electrostatic forces and 112 only deposit once they are heavy enough. This prevents them from interacting with the 113 reactor walls that could act like a catalyst [Szopa et al., 2006]. 114

The PAMPRE-produced tholins are small spherical particles with a mean diame-115 ter between 0.093 and 1.070  $\mu$ m [Hadamcik et al., 2009]; they are regarded as possible 116 analogs of Titan's organic aerosols. They form aggregates which can be observed micro-117

scopically and have the macroscopic appearance of an orange powder (see Figure A.1) in agreement with the color of Titan's haze.

**2.2 The PAP measurement bench** 

132

154

The central instrument of the PAP (French acronym for Permittivité d'Analogues 121 Planétaires, permittivity of planetary analogs) measurement bench developed at LATMOS 122 is a spectral analyzer (Solartron Modulab Material Test System<sup>©</sup>). The spectral analyzer 123 uses a dipole system to generate an alternating current at frequencies in the range 1 Hz 124 - 100 kHz between two electrodes separated by the cylindrical sample of material to be 125 analyzed. The current and potential on the electrodes are then measured giving access to 126 the complex impedance of the sample and thereby to its complex permittivity i.e., both its 127 dielectric constant and electrical conductivity . The PAP electrodes are cylindrical with a 128 radius of 10 mm and a height of 8 mm. An additional module was installed in order to 129 measure currents down to the femto-Ampere which is necessary for materials with low 130 dielectric constant and/or conductivity. 131

- The PAP measurement bench also includes:
- 1. A mechanical press to produce samples of varying bulk density. Samples are shaped 133 as cylinder pellets of 10 mm diameter with a height of 1 mm. A pressure of up to  $8.8 \times 10^8$  Pa (maximum tonnage of 7 tons) can be applied to them. 135 2. A sample holder in which the electrodes and the sample are placed. 136 3. A pump to create vacuum (minimum  $10^{-2}$  mbar) in the sample holder in order to 137 prevent contamination by water ice (formed by condensation of the water in the air) 138 of the sample when the temperature drops. 139 4. A cryostat to perform measurements at low temperatures. Cryogenic temperatures 140 are reached by passive cooling, filling up with liquid nitrogen the reservoir in which 141 the sample holder is placed. The temperature is recorded on both electrodes by 142 PT100 temperature sensors. The temperatures recorded on the two electrodes are 143 very close and we use the average of these two measurements to estimate the sam-144 ple temperature. The lowest achievable temperature with this device is about 94 K, 145 i.e. Titan's surface temperature at the HLS, and is obtained after  $\approx 1$  hr of cooling. 146 After about 10 hrs all liquid nitrogen is evaporated and the temperature increases back to room temperature within about an additional 10 hrs. The temperature range 148 for our measurements is therefore from 94 K up to room temperature. 149

The PAP set-up is designed to measure the complex permittivity of solid samples. In a harmonic regime and using complex notation, it is common to refer to the relative complex permittivity of the medium (i.e., relative to that of vacuum  $\epsilon_0 = 8.854 \times 10^{-12}$ F/m) defined for fields and potentials in  $exp(j\omega t)$  as follows:

$$\epsilon_r = \epsilon_r' - j\epsilon_r'' \tag{1}$$

The real part of the permittivity  $\epsilon'_r$  (hereafter referred to as the dielectric constant) describes the polarizability of a material when an electrical field is applied. Its imaginary part  $\epsilon''_r$  is related to the electrical effective conductivity  $\sigma$  as follows:  $\epsilon''_r = \sigma/2\pi f \epsilon_0$  with *f* the working frequency. We note that while pure dielectric materials have, by definition, a zero true conductivity (i.e., no free charge), polarization mechanisms induce the heat dissipation of electrical energy, which gives rise to a non-null effective conductivity.

The derivation of the complex permittivity from PAP measurements is described in Appendix A.

#### 2.3 Description of the samples

163

188

199

202

The tholin samples were produced by the PAMPRE experiment for 3 different compositions of the initial gas mixture: 2%, 5% and 8% of CH<sub>4</sub>. We investigated 15 samples i.e., 5 per composition totaling up to 300 hours of measurements most of which could be done unattended.

The material density of the tholins was measured using a helium pycnometer (Upyc-168 1200e-V5.04) which evaluates the volume occupied by a given sample with a known mass 169 in a calibrated chamber by inserting helium gas in the chamber. The measured material 170 densities (i.e. zero-porosity densities) are:  $\rho_{tholins2\%} = 1.45 \pm 0.02$ ,  $\rho_{tholins5\%} = 1.44 \pm 0.03$ 171 and  $\rho_{tholins8\%} = 1.34 \pm 0.03$ . The porosity of the compressed samples measured with 172 PAP can be readily inferred from these material densities. We find that the porosity of our 173 samples is in the range 10-40%. Our experimental set up cannot produce samples with 174 porosity out of this range. Samples with porosity >40% are too loose to be handled and 175 placed in the sample holder. On the other hand, the mechanical press cannot compress further the samples. Of note, the material density values we found are consistent with those published by Imanaka et al. [2012] ( $\rho_{tholins10\%} = 1.35 \pm 0.05$ ) but higher than 178 those published by Trainer et al. [2006] ( $\rho_{tholins} = 0.8 \pm 0.05$ ) and Hörst and Tolbert 179 [2013] ( $\rho_{tholins} \approx 0.5 - 1.15$ ). The difference in the experimental setup used to produce the tholins prevents a direct comparison although it seems that UV irradiation of  $CH_4$ 181 produces lower density tholins. 182

Futhermore, the composition of the initial gas mixture has an effect on the optical properties of the tholins; the higher the methane content the darker they appear. Additionally, the 2% samples were found to be less sticky and making pellets out of them proved to be more difficult than for the other compositions.

#### **3** Complex permittivity of tholins

#### 3.1 Effect of porosity

Figure A.2 shows the effect of porosity on the samples electrical properties. Overall and as expected, both the real and the imaginary parts of the permittivity decrease when porosity increases, vacuum having the lowest possible values of dielectric constant and conductivity (namely  $\epsilon'_{r0} = 1$  and  $\epsilon''_{r0} = 0$ ).

<sup>193</sup> We use these measurements to determine the complex permittivity of the bulk tholins <sup>194</sup> (i.e., with no porosity). This can be achieved by using a mixing law to "correct" the elec-<sup>195</sup> trical properties of the investigated tholin samples for the contribution of vacuum. More <sup>196</sup> specifically, we use the Maxwell-Garnett law [*Garnett*, 1904], which is the mixing law <sup>197</sup> that best fits the data points presented in Figure A.2. This law relates the complex permit-<sup>198</sup> tivity of the sample to its porosity p as follows:

$$\epsilon_{rsample} = \epsilon_{rm} + 3p\epsilon_{rm} \frac{1 - \epsilon_{rm}}{1 + 2\epsilon_{rm} - p(1 - \epsilon_{rm})}$$
(2)

(3)

where  $\epsilon_{rm}$  is the bulk permittivity of tholins that can then be estimated by solving the second-degree equation:

$$2(p-1)\epsilon_{rm}^2(p\epsilon_{rsample} - 2p + 2\epsilon_{rm} - 1)\epsilon_{rm} + \epsilon_{rsample}(1-p) = 0$$

The Maxwell-Garnett mixing law assumes that the void (spherical) pores (valid for p < 0.5) are smaller than the wavelength (300 m) which is readily achieved in our case. For example, at 94 K, 100 Hz and for a 5% methane composition the corrected complex permittivity is 4.5-j0.02.

#### **3.2 Effect of frequency and temperature**

Figure A.3 shows the complex permittivity of bulk tholins (i.e., once the correction described in section 3.1 has been applied) as a function of frequency and temperature for the three considered initial gas mixture compositions. The continuous lines and the shaded areas respectively represent the average and the standard deviation (at  $2-\sigma$ ) of the 5 samples measured per composition.

As expected, the dielectric constant increases with a decreasing frequency because polarization mechanisms have more time to take place when the applied electric field is slowly oscillating. Also the frequency dependence tends to disappear and the dielectric constant decreases when the temperature decreases i.e., when charge carriers become too slow to follow the applied electric field oscillations whether these oscillations are rapid or not. In particular, at Titan's surface temperature the dielectric constant seems to have reached its static limit.

The imaginary part of the complex permittivity displays a maximum at a frequency that moves towards lower values when the temperature decreases (1000 Hz at 220 K and 1 Hz at 170 K). The relaxation process at play may be a Maxwell-Wagner effect (i.e., interfacial polarization between the pores and the tholin matrix). At very low temperatures (in particular at 94 K), the relaxation peak is not visible anymore. Like for the real part, the imaginary part of the permittivity decreases with decreasing temperatures.

3.3 Effect of composition

226

We note a significant change in the electrical properties as a function of the composition of the gas mixture (i.e., the  $N_2/CH_4$  ratio) from which they have been produced. The "5%-tholins" have the largest dielectric constant while the "8%-tholins" have the smallest (Figure A.4). This is true for all frequencies in the range 1 Hz-100 kHz.

For temperature in the range 125-225 K, the imaginary part of the permittivity of the tholins increases with an increasing methane proportion in the PAMPRE gas mixture. Outside this temperature range, the "2%-tholins" methane proportion still has the smallest imaginary part of the permittivity but the "5% tholins" has the largest (see Figure A.4). This is true for all frequencies in the range 1 Hz-100 kHz.

At 94 K and at a given frequency the dielectric constant varies by 0.5 and the imaginary part of the permittivity by 0.02 between the 3 studied compositions. This variation is larger than the accuracy of the spectral analyzer and higher than the dispersion of the measurements performed on multiple samples which gives us, in theory, the ability to distinguish between the different compositions.

Tholins show very low concentration of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons [Derenne 241 et al., 2012; Mahjoub et al., 2016], therefore, the differences observed in the electrical 242 properties are probably not due to the presence of aromatic components. Mahjoub et al. 243 [2012] investigate the optical indices of tholins as a function of the methane percentage 244 used in the initial gas mixture. They find that the 2% tholins are far more absorbant in 245 the UV-visible than the 8% tholins and explain this difference by the quantity of nitro-246 247 gen incorporated in the tholins, primarily in amines, which was found to be higher at low methane fraction in the initial gas. In amines, the nitrogen has a non-binding electrical 248 doublet which results in a higher dielectric constant. This could explain the differences 249 between the 8% and 5% tholins but the fact that the 2% tholins have a lower dielectric 250 constant than the 5% suggests that additional unknown mechanisms influence the electrical 251 properties. 252

The measured dielectric constant of tholins at low frequency is relatively close but different from that of water ice (3.15 at cryogenic temperatures [*Mattei et al.*, 2014]) or of Martian analog JSC-Mars-1 (2.0-2.5 at 220 K [*Simões et al.*, 2004]). Furthermore, at low frequencies most rocky materials present on the Earth have a dielectric constant in the
 range 3.4 (dry sandy soil [*Clark*, 1966]) - 13.0 (sandstone [*Clark*, 1966]).

258

262

#### 3.4 Dielectric relaxation model for tholins

<sup>259</sup> One of the most commonly used models to represent the frequency dependence of the electrical properties of material is the Cole-Cole model with conduction [*Cole and Cole*, 1941]:

$$\epsilon_r(f,T) = \epsilon_{\infty}(T) + \frac{\epsilon_s(T) - \epsilon_{\infty}(T)}{1 + (j2\pi f\tau(T))^{1-\alpha}} - j\frac{\sigma_s}{2\pi f\epsilon_0}$$
(4)

where  $\epsilon_{\infty}$  is the relative high-frequency limit permittivity,  $\epsilon_s$  the static (low-frequency limit) relative permittivity,  $\tau$  the relaxation time in seconds,  $\sigma_s$  the static conductivity and  $\alpha$  an exponent representing the broadness of the relaxation transition. It is reduced to the Debye equation when  $\alpha = 0$ .

Figure A.5 shows the Cole-Cole model best fitting to our measurements in the complex plane (plotted with different scales for  $\epsilon'_r$  and  $\epsilon''_r$ ) at a temperature of 94 K for tholins obtained with 5% of methane. The best-fit parameters are:  $\epsilon_s = 4.24$ ,  $\epsilon_{\infty} = 4.53$ ,  $\tau = 2.0 \times 10^{-4}$  s,  $\alpha = 0.84$ ,  $\sigma_s = 0.0183$  S/m.

Complementary electrical characterization of tholins are available in literature (see 271 Table 1). In particular, Rodriguez et al. [2003] and Paillou et al. [2008] measured the 272 complex permittivity of tholins obtained from a 2% methane atmosphere in the Ku-band 273 (namely at 10 and 13 GHz) and at 77 K to support the analysis of the Cassini Radar observations Elachi et al. [2004]. Paillou et al. [2008] reported a permittivity of 1.17-j0.0033 275 for a "non-compacted sample" of tholins and of 2.33-j0.0206 for a "compacted sample". 276 These values are logically below the ones measured at lower frequencies as explained in 277 section 3.2. It would have been useful to know the actual porosity of the samples inves-278 tigated in the Ku-band in order to determine the permittivity of bulk tholins in this fre-279 quency range as we did in the 1 Hz-100 kHz domain (section 3.1). However, we do know 280 that the "compacted samples" were obtained with a press tonnage of 15 t, which suggests 281 that their porosity is at most 10 % [Paillou, personal communication] hence a maximum 282 permittivity of 2.55-j0.025 based on the Maxwell-Garnett law. Interestingly, we note that 283 the dielectric constant of tholins is larger than that of water ice at low frequencies while it 284 is the opposite in the Ku-band.

More recently, *Brouet et al.* [2016] measured the dielectric constant of tholins synthesized from a 5% methane atmosphere in the frequency range 50 MHz-2 GHz but at a warm temperature of 243 K.

Therefore, contrary to water ice, tholins do not seem to fully lose the frequency 289 dependence of their dielectric constant at very low temperature. The main polarization 290 mechanism responsible for the dielectric constant of water ice is the reorientation of  $H_2O$ 291 molecules. This mechanism is greatly affected by temperature and this explains why the 292 dielectric constant of water ice loses its frequency dependence at temperature below about 293 150 K [Mattei et al., 2014]. In the case of tholins, the polarization mechanisms at stake 294 must be more complex and more numerous. Their investigation is out of scope of this pa-295 per. 296

#### <sup>297</sup> 4 Titan's subsurface composition at the Huygens Landing site

#### 298

### 4.1 State of art: permittivity of Titan's near-surface, case of the HLS

The first estimate of the dielectric constant of Titan's near-surface was derived from observations from the Arecibo radar system: *Campbell et al.* [2003] found a range of di-

electric constants of 1.5-2.2 with a mean value of 1.8 for Titan's 26 °S latitude band (we recall that the Huygens landing site is at a latitude of 10.3 °S). After the arrival of the Cassini probe at Saturn, the Radar on board (operating at 13.78 GHz, *Elachi et al.* [2004]) provided new and spatially resolved constraints on the dielectric constants of Titan's nearsurface both in its real-aperture active (scatterometry) and passive (radiometry) modes.

The analysis of the scatterometry data yields dielectric constants in the range 1.9-3.6 with a mean value of 2.2 [*Wye et al.*, 2007]. This analysis is based on raster scanning of large regions at a resolution of about 100 km. No comprehensive investigation of the dielectric constant of the HLS has been published yet. However, it probably exhibits a dielectric constant close to that measured in the plains of Titan, namely,  $2.12 \pm 0.07$  [*Wye et al.*, 2007].

Radiometry insights into the surface dielectric constant come in two flavors. First, 312 when the spacecraft is far away from Titan (25 000-100 000 km), the disk is scanned 313 twice in two orthogonal polarizations (the spacecraft is rotated between the two scans). 314 These polarization pairs can be used to produce a global map of the surface dielectric constant [Janssen et al., 2009, 2016]. This map is essentially low resolution (300-500 km) 316 except for a a few regions that could be observed in mid-resolution in the two orthogonal 317 polarizations during two different flybys. This is fortunately the case of the HLS region for which the dielectric map has a resolution of about 100 km and indicates a value of 319  $1.7 \pm 0.2$ . For comparison, the global dielectric map displays values in the range 1.0 (no 320 polarization plus some allowance for error)-2.25 with an average of 1.54. 321

Second, the radiometry observations collected at all resolutions (from 5 to 500 km) can be used to build a mosaic of Titan's surface emissivity at 2.2-cm at normal incidence [*Janssen et al.*, 2009, 2016]. The emissivity map has a resolution of about 5 km at the Huygens landing site, which has been observed several times at closest approach. It indicates an emissivity of  $0.94 \pm 0.01$ , which implies, if this region does not depart too much from a Kirchhoff surface, an effective dielectric constant of  $2.7 \pm 0.25$ .

The discrepancy between the effective relative permittivity derived from the polarized radiometry measurements  $(1.7 \pm 0.2)$  and the effective relative permittivity derived from the emissivity at normal incidence  $(2.7 \pm 0.25)$  suggests that Kirchhoff's approximation does not apply in general to the HLS region. Surface small-scale roughness or, more likely, volume scattering from the subsurface must be invoked in order to reconcile these two observations, although their different resolutions may play a part too. The average effective dielectric constant at 13.78 GHz of the Huygens landing site region must thus lie between 1.5 and 3.0 as also suggested by the scatterometry analysis.

The imaginary part of the complex permittivity of Titan's surface was not measured by the Cassini Radar/radiometer but the analysis of the seasonal thermal wave points to a mean 2.2-cm emission depth in the range 40–100 cm for the dominant radar-dark terrains, consistent with the value  $\epsilon_r''$  of tholins as measured by *Paillou et al.* [2008][*Janssen et al.*, 2016].

Lastly, the permittivity probe PWA-MIP/HASI on board the Huygens probe mea-341 sured both the real and imaginary parts of the complex permittivity of the HLS in the 342 EVL (Extremely and Very Low) frequency range. At 45 Hz (frequency for which the 343 PWA-MIP calibration is best), *Hamelin et al.* [2016] found  $\epsilon'_r = 2.55 \pm 0.35$  and  $\epsilon''_r$  in 344 the interval 0.2 – 0.8 for the first 11 min after the landing and  $\epsilon'_r = 2.35 \pm 0.35$  and  $\epsilon''_r$  in 345 the interval 0 - 0.1 after. These values are consistent with the ones previously published 346 [Grard et al., 2006] but with more reliable error bars that account for uncertainties related 347 to the probe's resting attitude on the surface. 348

More importantly, we highlight that the sounding depths of the Cassini Radar/radiometer and of PWA-MIP/HASI are similar: both instruments are sensitive to the composition and structure of, roughly, the first meter below the surface [*Hamelin et al.*, 2016; *Janssen et al.*, <sup>352</sup> 2016]. More specifically, in the case of PWA-MIP/HASI it is a weighted volume average <sup>353</sup> of the first meter with a weight decreasing with depth (for a more in depth discussion see <sup>354</sup> *Lethuillier* [2016]). All the observations mentioned above are reported in Table 2. They <sup>355</sup> are further discussed in the following section.

356

#### 4.2 Constraints on the composition of the HLS from dielectric measurements

Based on the values presented in Table 2 and assuming that they are all representative of the HLS, we put some constraints on the composition of the subsurface in this region.

The range of permittivity values reported in section 4.1 is consistent with the ex-360 pected dielectric constants of materials relevant to Titan (see Table 1). More specifically, 361 permittivity values derived from microwave observations overlap those of solid and liquid 362 hydrocarbons. They preclude solid sheets of water ice but not water ice in a porous form. 363 Indeed, we highlight that the values reported above are effective dielectric constants; they 364 depend on both the composition and physical state of the surface/subsurface. In particular, 365 they are affected by the subsurface porosity. As a consequence, microwave observations 366 do not proscribe a fractured, porous water ice surface which would exhibit an effective 367 dielectric constant much smaller than 3.15, the dielectric constant of bulk water ice. Like-368 wise, while low-frequency observations preclude a compacted layer of tholin-like organics they do allow tholins as part of the near-surface composition. Assuming that the composi-370 tion of the first meter below the surface is a ternary mixture of water ice, tholin dust and 371 pores (empty, partially or fully filled with liquid methane), we use both microwave and 372 PWA-MIP/HASI results to constrain the respective proportion of these ingredients. 373

For that purpose, we also assume that Titan's tholins are similar to those synthesized 374 in laboratory from a mixture 95/5 of  $N_2/CH_4$  as this is the gas mixture that produces the largest abundance of solid aerosols [Sciamma-O'Brien et al., 2010]. Further, based on the 376 idea that the real part of the permittivity of liquid methane at 94 K should be identical 377 at near-DC and microwave frequencies, we use the same value of 1.67 in both frequency 378 domains as measured by *Leese et al.* [2012] at 100 Hz (see Table 1). Unfortunately, this 379 latter assumption cannot be made for the imaginary part of the permittivity for which no 380 measurement at PWA-MIP/HASI frequencies is available in literature. As a consequence, 381 as long as the low-frequency electrical properties of liquid hydrocarbons are not investigated in laboratory, the PWA-MIP/HASI measurements of  $\epsilon_r^{\prime\prime}$  cannot be used to place 383 constraints on the composition of Titan's near-surface. However, we highlight that the  $\epsilon_r$ 384 value measured by PWA-MIP/HASI just after landing (see Table 2) is larger, by one or 385 even two orders of magnitude than the expected values for tholins and water ice (see Table 1). Since liquid hydrocarbons likely also have a small loss tangent (as measured in labo-387 ratory in the microwave domain (see Table 1) and shown to be true at the surface of Titan by Mastrogiuseppe et al. [2014]), PWA-MIP/HASI measurements suggest that an extra 389 conductive material is present at the HLS. The removal of this material may explain the sudden drop of conductivity recorded 11 min after the Huygens landing. This hypothesis 391 is further discussed in section 4.3. 392

Figure A.6 shows the lower and upper limits of the volumetric fractions of the three 393 considered ingredients of the near-surface as derived from the microwave (red) and PWA-394 MIP/HASI (blue) observations using the Hashin-Shtrikman bounds of the Maxwell-Garnett 205 mixing formula [Hashin and Shtrikman, 1962]. These limits are shown on ternary dia-396 grams; where they intercept (gray area) is the most likely composition of the first meter 397 below the surface of the Huygens landing site. This derivation was done assuming that the 398 subsurface pores are saturated by liquid methane (Figure A.6a), filled with 50% of liquid methane (Figure A.6b) and empty (Figure A.6c). Constraints from microwave observations 400 are obtained assuming a dielectric constant of  $2.2 \pm 0.1$  (see section 4.1). Note that our 401 approach requires a good estimate of the dielectric constant of the HLS which is not avail-402

able to date, especially in the microwave domain. However, our goal here is to show that,
if both the microwave and ELF dielectric constants of the ground were known with a good
accuracy, we would be able to reliably constrain its composition because the constraints
associated with these measurements are "perpendicular" to each other. This method could
prove to be very valuable to future surface investigations of Titan.

While not very constraining, some lessons can be extracted from these diagrams. 408 In particular, it seems that some porosity (at least 15%) and the presence of the water ice 409 (at least 8%) are absolutely required to explain Cassini-Huygens observations while that 410 of tholins is not. This means that the subsurface of the HLS could, in theory, consists of 411 a porous water ice layer (60-75% water ice and 25-40% porosity if the pores are empty). 412 However, the composition is most likely a combination of water ice and organic dust with 413 some porosity, as suggested by the images taken at the surface by the Huygens probe and 414 most of the plausible combinations displayed on Figure A.6. If the nature of the dust is 415 tholin-like then its volumetric fraction in the first meter below the surface is at most 50-416 60%. Coherently, when the occupancy rate of the pores by liquid methane increases, less 417 water ice and/or tholins are required in the mixture. The porosity should vary in the range 418 15-40% for empty pores and 30-65% for saturated pores. 419

420

#### 4.3 Constraints on the composition of the HLS from the 11-min event

This work also offers the opportunity to investigate further the implications of our favorite scenario for the sudden drop of conductivity (or  $\epsilon_r''$ ) observed by the PWA-MIP/HASI instrument about 11 min after the Huygens landing [*Hamelin et al.*, 2016] (see also Table 2).

425

441

#### 4.3.1 Description of observations

The conductivity drop observed by PWA-MIP/HASI occurred in a very short amount 426 of time (2-4 s) and concerns an area, below the Huygens lander, as wide as the distance 427 between the MIP electrodes i.e. 1-2 m [Hamelin et al., 2016]. We reiterate that the con-428 current observed decrease in  $\epsilon'_r$  is not strong enough (relative to measurement uncertainty) 429 to be considered significant. On the other hand, the HASI temperature sensors on board 430 the Huygens probe did measure a significant drop of 0.2 K at the same time[Hamelin 431 et al., 2016] and the Huygens GCMS (Gas Chromatographer Mass Spectrometer) recorded 432 a continuous increase in the atmospheric methane suggesting the progressive vaporization of methane in the subsurface due to heating by the probe [Lorenz et al., 2006; Niemann 434 et al., 2010]. Additionally, the formation of a dewdrop was observed in a camera image 435 and could be linked to rising air with high methane humidity also due to the heating of 436 the surface by the bottom of the probe [Karkoschka and Tomasko, 2009]. Lastly, an unexplained attenuation was observed approximately 10 min after landing in the measurements 438 performed by the acoustic instrument located near the bottom of the probe [Lorenz et al., 439 2014]. 440

4.3.2 Favored scenario

Based on these observations and the fact that the initially measured value of  $\epsilon_r''$ (0.5 ± 0.3) is much higher than the values expected for water ice and tholins (see Table 1) we favor the following course of events:

445	1. The Huygens probe was internally heated by internal power dissipation by the pri-
446	mary batteries during the descent and on the surface (around 250 W, [Lorenz, 2006]).
447	2. After landing, part of the heat was dissipated in the atmosphere by convection, the
448	remaining being dissipated in the ground by conduction with the total heat dissi-
449	pated being around 350 W [Lorenz, 2006].

- This heating leads to the vaporization of a portion of the subsurface liquid hydrocarbons filling the pores.
  - 4. An outgassing burst occurred about 11 min after landing and removed a thin superficial layer of dust responsible for the observed conductivity.

The vaporization of liquid hydrocarbons and, above all, the removal of a superficial conductive dust layer would explain the observed drop in the near-surface electrical properties. Such removal would affect mainly the imaginary part of the subsurface permittivity, as observed. We note that the final value measured by PWA-MIP/HASI ( $\epsilon_r''$  in the interval 0-0.1) is compatible with a subsurface composed of any combination of water ice, tholins and vacuum.

As a further argument [Lorenz, 2006] estimates that a total of 500 kJ of energy 460 could have been transferred to the subsurface in about an hour after landing. This would 461 be sufficient to evaporate approximately 1 cm of liquid methane (approximately 0.91 kg). 462 This value reduces to 0.2 kg if we take into account the possibility that the probe bounced 463 before finding its final resting position (as suggested by Schröder et al. [2012]) reducing its 464 contact with the surface (we consider a contact area 4 times smaller than Lorenz [2006]). 465 Of importance, the penetrometer on board the Surface Science Package (SSP) of the Huy-466 gens probe detected the presence of a 7-mm dust layer at the landing site [Atkinson et al., 467 2010]. This layer is likely composed of organic particles of low-density, therefore easily 468 removable by the vaporizing of subsurface liquid. 469

#### 4.3.3 Source of the conductivity

452

453

470

In the scenario previously mentioned the source of the conductivity is a thin layer of 471 dust located at the surface and the removal of this layer would cause the observed drop in 472 conductivity. Although solar UV can cause photoelectron production at planetary surfaces, 473 in the case of Titan the UV flux is completely absorbed by the atmosphere and so this ef-474 fect cannot influence the near-surface environment. Another possibility is the ionization of 475 the near-surface atmosphere by decay of  ${}^{14}C$ . According to [Lorenz et al., 2002] the decay 476 rate near the surface is capable of producing  $10^4$  cm<sup>-2</sup> ion pairs leading to a high air con-477 ductivity possibly detectable by PWA-MIP/Huygens. The outgassing from the subsurface 478 could have led to the removal of the radiocarbons close to the probe therefore reducing the 479 atmospheric conductivity in the vicinity of the instrument. This scenario could be mod-480 eled in order to evaluate the maximum conductivity of the atmosphere close to the lander 481 and to appraise whether or not the atmospheric conductivity could explain the conductiv-482 ity measured by PWA-MIP/HASI. However, the accurate modeling of this phenomenon 483 and the addition of a highly conductive atmosphere near the Huygens probe is not a simple task and out of the scope of this work. In addition, we consider this scenario unlikely 485 compared to the one described below. 486

Our favored explanation for the measured conductivity at the HLS after landing is 487 the existence of a superficial layer of dust material with a non negligible intrinsic con-488 ductivity. In order to constrain the required characteristics, namely the thickness and con-489 ductivity, of this putative superficial conductive layer, we conducted numerical simulations with a finite element code (COMSOL Multiphysics<sup>TM</sup>, see [Hamelin et al., 2016] for 491 more detail) assuming a 2-layer subsurface. The numerical simulations take in account the 492 whole of the Huygens probe (for numerical reasons the probe's shape had to be simplified, 493 see [Hamelin et al., 2016] for the details of the simplification) in its two extreme attitudes 494 at the surface (see [Hamelin et al., 2016] for a description of these extreme cases). Per-495 forming numerical simulations for a set of thicknesses of the dust layer we provide esti-496 mates of the dust electrical conductivity required to explain the observed drop in electrical 497 conductivity 11 min after landing. Figure A.7 shows the resulting upper and lower limits 498 of the imaginary part of the effective permittivity of the conductive layer as a function of 499 its thickness (the upper and lower limits include the uncertainty on the probe attitude at 500

the surface, whereas the error bars account for the numerical error of the model and the measurement uncertainty of the PWA-MIP/HASI instrument). We note that if the thickness of the removed conductive layer is 7 mm (as suggested by [*Atkinson et al.*, 2010]) then the imaginary part of its permittivity must be relatively high, namely between 2.8 and 16.0 (corresponding to a conductivity in the range 7-40 nS/m). Logically, the required imaginary part of the permittivity decreases as the thickness of the conductive layer increases; its lower limit is  $0.5 \pm 0.3$ .

#### 4.3.4 Composition of the dust layer

508

Regarding the implications of this investigation on the composition of the putative 509 conductive 7 mm superficial layer, we are unfortunately hampered by the lack of available 510 information in literature on the conductivity of materials relevant to Titan's at low temper-511 atures and low frequencies. One thing is certain: the tholins studied in this work do not 512 have a high enough imaginary part to be a major component of this layer. Likewise, the 513 DC conductivity of polyacetylene at 200 K is at most  $10^{-7}$  S/m<sup>-1</sup> and shows a linear de-514 crease with temperature [Jones et al., 1991], preventing it from being a major component 515 of this layer. On the other hand, some polymers, such as polyaniline, or in general, nitrilerich organic compounds may be more conductive but their accurate electrical properties 517 remain unknown [Le Gall et al., 2016]. Also, nanophase iron and nanophase hematite 518 which are present in Saturn's rings and on the surface of Iapetus [*Clark et al.*, 2012] may 519 have relatively high conductivity at low frequencies/low temperatures: Nikolic et al. [2012] measured the DC electrical conductivity of hematite doped with Zn and, by extrapolating 521 their results at Titan's surface temperature, the maximum conductivity is found to  $10^{-8}$ 522 S/m, therefore, the possibility that hematite (doped with 10% Zn) as a major component 523 of this layer cannot be excluded but is very low (the highest conductivity value of this 524 component is only slightly higher than the lowest possible conductivity of this layer, addi-525 tionally, this only applies to hematite with high Zn content, higher than 10%). Although 526 no measurement of electrical properties of nanophase iron relevant to Titan were found 527 in the literature, powdered metals tend to have a high conductivity. Therefore nanophase iron is most likely at least somewhat conductive and could be a potential component of 529 this layer. Lastly, we note that the photochemical aging of Titan's aerosols during their 530 sedimentation through Titan's atmosphere [Couturier-Tamburelli et al., 2018] and possibly 531 also at the surface can produce aerosols that are more conductive that the "fresh" tholins 532 synthesized in laboratory and analyzed in this work. Future works should consider investi-533 gating the electrical properties of "processed tholins". 534

#### 535 **5** Conclusion and perspectives

The measurements performed by the PWA-MIP/HASI/Huygens/Cassini-Huygens in-536 strument in 2005 provided unique insights into the electrical properties of the first meter 537 of Titan's subsurface. However, in order to convert these measurements in term of com-538 position, the low-frequency and low temperature electrical properties of materials possibly 530 present at the surface of Titan need to be known. In this paper, we present the first low frequency electrical characterization of samples of tholins. Tholins are organic matter, 541 possibly analogous to the aerosols produced in the atmosphere of Titan and then deposited 542 onto the surface. Their electrical characterization was performed with a dedicated mea-543 surement bench developed at LATMOS. We find that the electrical properties of tholins 544 follow predictable variations (i.e., the real and imaginary parts of the permittivity decrease 545 with higher frequency, higher porosity and lower temperature) and show significant varia-546 tions as a function of the composition of the gaseous mixture from which they were pro-547 duced. Based on multi-frequency laboratory electrical characterizations and combining 548 measurements from PWA-MIP/HASI and the Cassini Radar, we derive constraints on the 549 composition of the Huygens Landing Site. While not very strong (a porosity between 15% 550

and 65%, a maximum of 60% of tholins and between 20% and 75% of water ice) our results and approach can serve as a frame of reference for future studies.

We also expand the study of the sudden and significant drop of conductivity ob-553 served about 11 min after the landing of Huygens at the surface of Titan which was pre-554 sented in Hamelin et al. [2016]. Our favored scenario describes how the subsurface was 555 heated by the probe after landing enough for some subsurface methane to vaporize. This 556 vaporizing methane may have then depleted a thin superficial conductive dust layer. Based on this scenario and numerical simulations we estimate the imaginary part of this conduc-558 tive dust layer to be at least 2.8 which is very high and rules out the tholins we studied as a main component of the putative superficial dust layer. To our knowledge there is no 560 material relevant to Titan's surface composition with such a high conductivity (more pre-561 cisely, the only known possibility would be hematite with a high quantity of Zn). How-560 ever, the electrical properties of a great number of possible materials remain to be investi-563 gated and we therefore emphasize the need for more laboratory characterization over wide 564 range of frequencies. 565

Lastly, we note that this work and our analysis approach will be useful for future 566 missions to Titan and, in particular, missions including a permittivity probe such as the 567 Dragonfly mission [Turtle et al., 2017], a relocatable quadcopter recently pre-selected for the New Frontiers program. If the mission is selected, Dragonfly permittivity measure-569 ments will most likely be more accurate than those performed by PWA-MIP/HASI and 570 will therefore provide much stronger constraints on the plausible composition of Titan's 571 subsurface and even discriminate between the different types of tholins at the surface . We also note for future missions to Titan, that, in order to differentiate between the differ-573 ent composition of tholins based on their electrical properties, certain frequencies would 574 be more useful than others. More specifically, at Titan's surface temperature, while the 575 real part shows significant difference between compositions at all frequencies (see Figure 5 left), the most relevant frequencies to capture differences in the imaginary part due to 577 composition are 100, 1000 and 5000 Hz (see Figure A.4a.). 578

#### A: Measurements and derivation of the sample complex permittivity

The spectrum analyzer measures the complex impedance of the sample between the electrodes sweeping the frequency range 1 Hz-100 kHz. For a given frequency, the same measurement is repeated 3 times and the average value is recorded. It takes about 22 s to measure the complex impedance over a full frequency spectrum. At the end of a typical measurement cycle which lasts about 20 h (10h for the liquid nitrogen to evaporate and 10 hours for the sample to return to room temperature), 3000 to 4000 spectra have been collected.

<sup>587</sup> The measured complex impedance  $Z_s$  (in  $\Omega$ ) is related to the capacitance C (in F) <sup>588</sup> of the parallel plate electrodes by:

$$C_s = \frac{1}{2\pi f j Z_s} \tag{A.1}$$

where f is the frequency of the input signal.

The complex capacitance of a parallel-plate capacitor is itself related to the complex relative permittivity of the medium between the parallel electrodes by:

$$\epsilon_r = \frac{C_s d}{A\epsilon_0} \tag{A.2}$$

593

589

590

where  $A [m^2]$  is the surface area of the electrodes (and generally of the sample) and d [m] is the thickness of the sample.

Equation A.2 applies well if the distance between the electrodes remains much smaller than their dimensions. In addition, it assumes that the electrical field is entirely concentrated in the dielectric medium between the plates and thus neglects edge effects which induce parasitic capacitances.

In order to correct measurements performed on samples from parasitic effects, we calibrate them by measurements made with an empty cell i.e., measurements performed after removing the sample from the sample holder but without changing the distance d between the electrodes. More specifically, we measure  $Z_{void}$  and thus  $C_{void}$  and equation A.2 becomes:

$$\epsilon_r = \frac{C_c d}{A\epsilon_0} \tag{A.3}$$

with  $C_c$  the corrected complex capacitance:

$$C_c = C_s + \frac{\epsilon_0 A}{d} - C_{void} \tag{A.4}$$

The effects of the electronics were evaluated and found to be negligible.

#### **Acknowledgments**

605

607

608

The PAP measurement bench was partialy funded by the DIM-ACAV (Domaine d'Intêret

Majeur-Astrophysique et Conditions d'Apparition de la Vie) program of the Région Ile-

de-France. The CNES (Centre National d'Etude Spatiale) also provided financial help for

material resources. The data reported in this paper are freely available at: ftp:/ftp.

<sup>614</sup> latmos.ipsl.fr/outgoing/lethuillier/PAP\_data/. The authors would like to

thank Ralph Lorenz and Elizabeth Turtle for their valuable comments from which the paper greatly benefited.

#### 617 **References**

- Atkinson, K. R., J. C. Zarnecki, M. C. Towner, T. J. Ringrose, A. Hagermann, A. J. Ball, 618 M. R. Leese, G. Kargl, M. D. Paton, R. D. Lorenz, and S. F. Green (2010), Penetrome-619 try of granular and moist planetary surface materials: Application to the Huygens land-620 ing site on Titan, Icarus, 210, 843-851, doi:10.1016/j.icarus.2010.07.019. 621 Barnes, J. W., R. H. Brown, L. Soderblom, C. Sotin, S. L. Mouèlic, S. Rodriguez, R. Jau-622 mann, R. A. Beyer, B. J. Buratti, K. Pitman, K. H. Baines, R. Clark, and P. Nichol-623 son (2008), Spectroscopy, morphometry, and photoclinometry of titan's dunefields from 624 cassini/vims, Icarus, 195(1), 400 - 414, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2007.12.006. 625 Borucki, W. J., Z. Levin, R. C. Whitten, R. G. Keesee, L. A. Capone, A. L. Summers, 626 O. B. Toon, and J. Dubach (1987), Predictions of the electrical conductivity and 627 charging of the aerosols in Titan's atmosphere, Icarus, 72, 604-622, doi:10.1016/ 628 0019-1035(87)90056-X. 629 Brouet, Y., A. C. Levasseur-Regourd, P. Sabouroux, L. Neves, P. Encrenaz, O. Poch, 630 A. Pommerol, N. Thomas, W. Kofman, A. Le Gall, V. Ciarletti, A. Hérique, A. Lethuil-631
- lier, N. Carrasco, and C. Szopa (2016), A porosity gradient in 67p/C-G nucleus sug-
- gested from CONSERT and SESAME-PP results: an interpretation based on new labo-
- ratory permittivity measurements of porous icy analogues, *Monthly Notices of the Royal*
- Astronomical Society, 462, S89–S98, doi:10.1093/mnras/stw2151.

636 637	Cable, M. L., S. M. Hörst, R. Hodyss, P. M. Beauchamp, M. A. Smith, and P. A. Willis (2012), Titan Tholins: Simulating Titan Organic Chemistry in the Cassini-Huygens Era,
638	Chemical Reviews, 112, 1882–1909, doi:10.1021/cr200221x.
639 640	Campbell, D. B., G. J. Black, L. M. Carter, and S. J. Ostro (2003), Radar Evidence for Liquid Surfaces on Titan, <i>Science</i> , <i>302</i> , 431–434, doi:10.1126/science.1088969.
641	Carrasco, N., T. Gautier, Et. Es-sebbar, P. Pernot, and G. Cernogora (2012), Volatile
642	products controlling Titan's tholins production, <i>Icarus</i> , 219, 230–240, doi:10.1016/j.
643	icarus.2012.02.034.
644	Clark, S. P. (1966), Handbook of Physical Constants, Geological Society of America.
645	Clark, R. N., J. M. Curchin, J. W. Barnes, R. Jaumann, L. Soderblom, D. P. Cruikshank,
646	R. H. Brown, S. Rodriguez, J. Lunine, K. Stephan, T. M. Hoeten, S. Le Mouèlic,
647	C. Sotin, K. H. Baines, B. J. Buratti, and P. D. Nicholson (2010), Detection and map-
648 649	ping of hydrocarbon deposits on 1itan, <i>Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets</i> , 115, E10,005, doi:10.1029/2009JE003369.
650	Clark, R. N., D. P. Cruikshank, R. Jaumann, R. H. Brown, K. Stephan, C. M. D. Ore,
651	K. E. Livo, N. Pearson, J. M. Curchin, T. M. Hoefen, B. J. Buratti, G. Filacchione,
652	K. H. Baines, and P. D. Nicholson (2012), The surface composition of iapetus: Map-
653	ping results from cassini vims, <i>Icarus</i> , 218(2), 831 – 860, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.
004	Clausen K C H Hassan M Verdant P Couzin G Huttin M Brisson C Sollazzo
655	and L-P Lebreton (2002) The Huygens Probe System Design Space Science Reviews
657	104 155–189 doi:10.1023/A:1023648925732
050	Cole K S and R H Cole (1941) Dispersion and Absorption in Dielectrics I Alter-
650	nating Current Characteristics. The Journal of Chemical Physics 9 341–351 doi:
660	10 1063/1 1750906
661	Couturier-Tamburelli I N Piétri V Le Letty T Chiavassa and M Gudinati (2018)
662	IV–Vis Light-induced Aging of Titan's Haze and Ice. <i>The Astrophysical Journal</i>
663	852(2), 117, doi:https://doi.org/10.3847/1538-4357/aa9e8d.
664	Derenne S C Coelho C Anguetil C Szopa A Rahman P McMillan F Corà
665	C. Pickard, E. Quirico, and C. Bonhomme (2012). New insights into the structure and
666	chemistry of titan's tholins via 13c and 15n solid state nuclear magnetic resonance spec-
667	troscopy, Icarus, 221(2), 844 – 853, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2012.03.003.
668	Elachi, C., M. D. Allison, L. Borgarelli, P. Encrenaz, E. Im, M. A. Janssen, W. T. K.
669	Johnson, R. L. Kirk, R. D. Lorenz, J. I. Lunine, D. O. Muhleman, S. J. Ostro, G. Pi-
670	cardi, F. Posa, C. G. Rapley, L. E. Roth, R. Seu, L. A. Soderblom, S. Vetrella, S. D.
671	Wall, C. A. Wood, and H. A. Zebker (2004), Radar: The cassini titan radar mapper,
672	<i>Space Science Reviews</i> , <i>115</i> (1), 71–110, doi:10.1007/s11214-004-1438-9.
673	Feuerbacher, B., M. Anderegg, B. Fitton, L. D. Laude, R. F. Willis, and R. J. L. Grard
674	(1972), Photoemission from lunar surface fines and the lunar photoelectron sheath,
675	in Lunar and Planetary Science Conference Proceedings, Lunar and Planetary Science
676	Conference Proceedings, vol. 3, edited by A. E. Metzger, J. I. Trombka, L. E. Peterson,
677	R. C. Reedy, and J. R. Arnold, p. 2655.
678	Fulchignoni, M., F. Ferri, F. Angrilli, A. J. Ball, A. Bar-Nun, M. A. Barucci, C. Bet-
679	tanini, G. Bianchini, W. Borucki, G. Colombatti, M. Coradini, A. Coustenis, S. De-
680	bei, P. Falkner, G. Fanti, E. Flamini, V. Gaborit, R. Grard, M. Hamelin, A. M. Harri,
681	B. Hathi, I. Jernej, M. R. Leese, A. Lehto, P. F. Lion Stoppato, J. J. Lopez-Moreno,
682	1. Makinen, J. A. M. McDonnell, C. P. McKay, G. Molina-Cuberos, F. M. Neubauer,
683	v. FIFTOREHO, K. KOdrigo, B. Saggin, K. Schwingenschuh, A. Seiff, F. Simoes, H. Sved-
684	nem, 1. Tokano, W. C. Towner, K. Traumer, P. Witners, and J. C. Zarnecki (2005), In situ mensuramenta of the physical characteristics of Titaria anticarrent. Nature (200
685	shu measurements of the physical characteristics of Than's environment, <i>Nature</i> , 438, 785, 701, doi:10.1038/noture04214
686	(0)-(7), uuli 10.1030/llatui 004314.
687	Transactions of the Royal Society of London A: Mathematical Physical and Engineering
689	Sciences, 203, 385–420, doi:10.1098/rsta.1904.0024.

690	Grard, R. (1995), Solar photon interaction with the martian surface and related electrical
691	and chemical phenomena, Icarus, 114(1), 130 – 138, doi:https://doi.org/10.1006/icar.
692	1995.1048.
693	Grard, R., M. Hamelin, J. J. López-Moreno, K. Schwingenschuh, I. Jernej, G. J. Molina-
694	Cuberos, F. Simões, R. Trautner, P. Falkner, F. Ferri, M. Fulchignoni, R. Rodrigo,
695	H. Svedhem, C. Béghin, J. J. Berthelier, V. J. G. Brown, M. Chabassière, J. M. Jeron-
696	imo, L. M. Lara, and T. Tokano (2006), Electric properties and related physical charac-
697	teristics of the atmosphere and surface of Titan, <i>Planetary and Space Science</i> , 54, 1124–
698	1136, doi:10.1016/j.pss.2006.05.036.
699	Griffith, C. A., T. Owen, T. R. Geballe, J. Ravner, and P. Rannou (2003), Evidence for the
700	Exposure of Water Ice on Titan's Surface. Science, 300, 628–630, doi:10.1126/science.
701	1081897.
702	Grundy, W. M., R. P. Binzel, B. J. Buratti, J. C. Cook, D. P. Cruikshank, C. M. D.
703	Ore, A. M. Earle, K. Ennico, C. J. A. Howett, A. W. Lunsford, C. B. Olkin, A. H.
704	Parker, S. Philippe, S. Protopana, E. Quirico, D. C. Reuter, B. Schmitt, K. N. Singer,
705	A. J. Verbiscer, R. A. Bever, M. W. Buje, A. F. Cheng, D. E. Jennings, I. R. Lin-
706	scott, J. W. Parker, P. M. Schenk, J. R. Spencer, J. A. Stansberry, S. A. Stern, H. B.
707	Throop, C. C. C. Tsang, H. A. Weaver, G. E. Weigle, L. A. Young, and a. t. N. H. S.
708	Team (2016). Surface compositions across Pluto and Charon. <i>Science</i> , 351, 6279, doi:
709	10.1126/science.aad9189.
710	Hadamcik E I B Renard G Alcouffe G Cernogora A C Levasseur-Regourd and
711	C. Szopa (2009). Laboratory light-scattering measurements with Titan's aerosols ana-
712	logues produced by a dusty plasma. <i>Planetary and Space Science</i> , 57, 1631–1641, doi:
713	10.1016/i.pss.2009.06.013.
714	Hamelin M A Lethuillier A Le Gall R Grard C Béghin K Schwingenschuh
715	I Jernei J-J López-Moreno V Brown R D Lorenz F Ferri and V Ciarletti (2016)
716	The electrical properties of Titan's surface at the Huygens landing site measured with
717	the PWA-HASI Mutual Impedance Probe. New approach and new findings. <i>Icarus</i> , 270.
718	272–290. doi:10.1016/i.jcarus.2015.11.035.
719	Hashin Z and S Shtrikman (1962) A variational approach to the theory of the effective
720	magnetic permeability of multiphase materials. <i>Journal of Applied Physics</i> , 33, 3125–
721	3131. doi:10.1063/1.1728579.
700	Hestermans P and D White (1961) The vapor pressures heats of vaporization and heat
722	capacities of methane from the boiling point to the critical temperature. <i>The Journal of</i>
724	Physical Chemistry, 65, 362–365, doi:10.1021/i100820a044.
705	Hörst S M and M A Tolbert (2013) In situ measurements of the size and density of
725	titan aerosol analogs The Astronhysical Journal Letters 770(1) I 10
720	Imanaka H D P Cruiksbank B N Khare and C P McKay (2012) Ontical constants
727	of titan tholins at mid-infrared wavelengths (2 5–25µm) and the possible chemical na-
720	ture of titan's haze particles $L_{carus} = 218(1) = 247 = 261$ doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j
730	icarus 2011 11 018
730	Janssen M A R D Lorenz R West F Paganelli R M Lones R I Kirk C Flachi
731	S D Wall W T K Johnson V Anderson R A Boehmer P Callaban V Gim G A
732	Hamilton K D Kelleher I Roth B Stiles and A Le Gall (2009) Titan's surface
733	at 2.2-cm wavelength imaged by the Cassini RADAR radiometer: Calibration and first
734	results Learns 200 222–239 doi:10.1016/j.jcarus 2008.10.017
/35	Jonsson M A A Le Cell P M Lones P D Lorenz M L Melecke A C
736	Jalissell, M. A., A. Le Gall, K. M. Lopes, K. D. Lorenz, M. J. Malaska, A. G. Haves, C. D. Neish, A. Solomonidou, K. I. Mitchell, I. Badebaugh, S. I. Keihm
131	M Choukroun C Levrat P I Encrenar and M Mastrogiusenne (2016). Titan's sur
/38	face at 2.18 cm wavalength imaged by the Cassini DADAD radiometery Decults and
/39	interpretations through the first ten years of observation Learns 270 442 450 doi:
740	10.1016/i icarus 2015 09 027
/41	Iones C B Lawrence I Martens B Friend D Darker W Faast M Lögdund
742	and W Salaneck (1991) Electronic properties of polyacetylene prepared by the
/43	and w. Salancek (1991), Electionic properties of polyacetylene prepared by the

744	durham 'photoisomer' route, <i>Polymer</i> , 32(7), 1200 – 1209, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/
745	0032-3861(91)90222-5.
746	Karkoschka, E., M. G. Tomasko, L. R. Doose, C. See, E. A. McFarlane, S. E. Schröder,
747	and B. Rizk (2007), DISR imaging and the geometry of the descent of the Huygens
748	probe within Titan's atmosphere, <i>Planetary and Space Science</i> , 55, 1896–1935, doi:10.
749	1016/j.pss.2007.04.019.
750	Karkoschka, E., and M. G. Tomasko (2009), Rain and dewdrops on titan based on in situ
751	imaging, <i>Icarus</i> , 199(2), 442 – 448, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2008.09.020.
752	Gall, A. L., M. Janssen, L. Wye, A. Hayes, J. Radebaugh, C. Savage, H. Zebker,
753	R. Lorenz, J. Lunine, R. Kirk, R. Lopes, S. Wall, P. Callahan, E. Stofan, and T. Farr
754 755	(2011), Cassini sar, radiometry, scatterometry and altimetry observations of titan's dune fields, <i>Icarus</i> , 213(2), 608 – 624, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2011.03.026.
756	Le Gall, A., M. J. Malaska, R. D. Lorenz, M. A. Janssen, T. Tokano, A. G. Hayes,
757	M. Mastrogiuseppe, J. I. Lunine, G. Veyssière, P. Encrenaz, and O. Karatekin (2016),
758	Composition, seasonal change, and bathymetry of Ligeia Mare, Titan, derived
759 760	from its microwave thermal emission, <i>Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets</i> , <i>121</i> ,233–251,doi:10.1002/2015JE004920.
761	Lebreton, JP., and D. L. Matson (2004), The Huygens mission to Titan: an overview,
762	in Titan - From Discovery to Encounter, ESA Special Publication, vol. 1278, edited by
763	K. Fletcher, pp. 229–242.
764	Lebreton, JP., O. Witasse, C. Sollazzo, T. Blancquaert, P. Couzin, AM. Schipper, J. B.
765	Jones, D. L. Matson, L. I. Gurvits, D. H. Atkinson, B. Kazeminejad, and M. Pérez-
766	Ayúcar (2005), An overview of the descent and landing of the Huygens probe on Titan,
767	Nature, 438, 758–764, doi:10.1038/nature04347.
768	Leese, M. R., R. D. Lorenz, B. Hathi, and J. C. Zarnecki (2012), The Huygens surface
769	science package (SSP): Flight performance review and lessons learned, Planetary and
770	Space Science, 70, 28–45, doi:10.1016/j.pss.2012.06.005.
771	Lethuillier, A. (2016), Characterization of planetary subsurfaces with permittivity probes :
772	analysis of the SESAME-PP/Philae and PWA-MIP/HASI/Huygens data, Theses, Univer-
773	sité Paris-Saclay.
774	Rodriguez, S., P. Paillou, M. Dobrijevic, G. Ruffié, P. Coll, J. M. Bernard, and P. Encrenaz
775	(2003), Impact of aerosols present in Titan's atmosphere on the CASSINI radar experi-
776	ment, <i>Icarus</i> , 164, 213–227, doi:10.1016/S0019-1035(03)00125-8.
777	Lopes, R., E. Stofan, R. Peckyno, J. Radebaugh, K. Mitchell, G. Mitri, C. Wood, R. Kirk,
778	S. wall, J. Lunine, A. Hayes, K. Lorenz, I. Farr, L. wye, J. Craig, K. Ollerensnaw,
779	M. Janssen, A. LeGan, F. Faganeni, K. West, D. Stiles, F. Cananan, T. Anderson, D. Valore, and J. Soderblom (2010). Distribution and interplay of geologic processes
780	on titan from cassini radar data <i>Learus</i> 205(2) 540 558 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/i
781	203(2), $340 - 358$ , $401.000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $101000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $100000$ , $100000$ , $100000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$ , $10000$
702	Lorenz R and I Mitton (2002) Lifting Titan's Veil: Exploring the Giant Moon of Saturn
784	Cambridge University Press.
785	Lorenz R A Jull T Swindle and I I Lunine (2002) Radiocarbon on titan <i>Meteoritics</i>
786	& Planetary Science, 37, 867 – 874.
787	Lorenz, R. D. (2006), Thermal interactions of the huygens probe with the titan environ-
788	ment: Constraint on near-surface wind, Icarus, 182(2), 559 - 566, doi:https://doi.org/10.
789	1016/j.icarus.2006.01.009
790	Lorenz, R. D., H. B. Niemann, D. N. Harpold, S. H. Way, and J. C. Zarnecki (2006), Ti-
791	tan's damp ground: Constraints on titan surface thermal properties from the temperature
792	evolution of the huygens gcms inlet, Meteoritics and Planetary Science, 41(11), 1705-
793	1714, doi:10.1111/j.1945-5100.2006.tb00446.x.
794	Lorenz, R. D., M. R. Leese, B. Hathi, J. C. Zarnecki, A. Hagermann, P. Rosenberg,
795	M. C. Towner, J. Garry, and H. Svedhem (2014), Silence on shangri-la: Attenuation
796	of huygens acoustic signals suggests surface volatiles, <i>Planetary and Space Science</i> ,
797	90(Supplement C), 72 – 80, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pss.2013.11.003.

798	Lorenz, R. D. (2014), The flushing of Ligeia: Composition variations across Titan's seas
799	in a simple hydrological model, <i>Geophysical Research Letters</i> , 41, 5764–5770, doi:10.
800	Mahioub A N Carrasco P-R Dahoo T Gautier C Szona and G Cernogora (2012)
802	Influence of methane concentration on the optical indices of titan's aerosols analogues,
803	<i>Icarus</i> , 221(2), 670 – 677, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icarus.2012.08.015.
804	Mahjoub, A., M. Schwell, N. Carrasco, Y. Benilan, G. Cernogora, C. Szopa, and MC.
805	Gazeau (2016), Characterization of aromaticity in analogues of titan's atmospheric
806	aerosols with two-step laser desorption ionization mass spectrometry, <i>Planetary and</i>
807 808	<i>Space Science</i> , <i>131</i> (Supplement C), 1 – 13, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pss.2016.05. 003.
809	Mattei, E., S. E. Lauro, G. Vannaroni, B. Cosciotti, F. Bella, and E. Pettinelli (2014), Di-
810 811	electric measurements and radar attenuation estimation of ice/basalt sand mixtures as martian Polar Caps analogues, <i>Icarus</i> , 229, 428–433, doi:10.1016/j.icarus.2013.10.017.
812	McDonald, G. D., W. R. Thompson, M. Heinrich, B. N. Khare, and C. Sagan (1994),
813	Chemical Investigation of Titan and Triton Tholins, <i>Icarus</i> , 108, 137–145, doi:10.1006/ icar 1994 1046
815	McDonald, G. D., L. J. Whited, C. DeRuiter, B. N. Khare, A. Patnaik, and C. Sagan
816	(1996), Production and Chemical Analysis of Cometary Ice Tholins, <i>Icarus</i> , 122, 107–
817	117, doi:10.1006/icar.1996.0112.
818	Mishra, A., M. Michael, S. N. Tripathi, and C. Béghin (2014), Revisited modeling of Ti-
819	tan's middle atmosphere electrical conductivity, <i>Icarus</i> , 238, 230–234, doi:10.1016/j.
820	icarus.2014.04.018.
821	Mitchell, K. L., M. B. Barmatz, C. S. Jamieson, R. D. Lorenz, and J. I. Lunine (2015), Laboratory measurements of ervogenic liquid alkane microwaya absorptivity and im
822	plications for the composition of Ligeia Mare. Titan Geophysical Research Letters 42
824	1340–1345, doi:10.1002/2014GL059475.
825	Niemann, H. B., S. K. Atreya, J. E. Demick, D. Gautier, J. A. Haberman, D. N. Harpold,
826	W. T. Kasprzak, J. I. Lunine, T. C. Owen, and F. Raulin (2010), Composition of Ti-
827	tan's lower atmosphere and simple surface volatiles as measured by the Cassini-Huygens
828	probe gas chromatograph mass spectrometer experiment, <i>Journal of Geophysical Re-</i>
829	Nikolic M M Slankamenac N Nikolic D Sekulic O Aleksic M Mitric T Ivetic
831	V. Pavlovic, and P. Nikolic (2012). Study of dielectric behavior and electrical properties
832	of hematite a-fe 2 o 3 doped with zn, <i>Science of Sintering</i> , 44, 307.
833	Paillou, P., J. Lunine, G. Ruffié, P. Encrenaz, S. Wall, R. Lorenz, and M. Janssen (2008),
834	Microwave dielectric constant of Titan-relevant materials, Geophysical Research Letters,
835	35, L18202, doi:10.1029/2008GL035216.
836	Pettinelli, E., S. E. Lauro, B. Cosciotti, E. Mattei, F. D. Paolo, and G. Vannaroni (2016),
837	Dielectric characterization of ice/mgs04 $\cdot$ 11n20 mixtures as jovian icy moon crust analogues. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 439(Supplement C) 11 – 17 doi:
838	https://doi.org/10.1016/i.epsl.2016.01.021.
840	Sagan, C., and B. Khare (1979). Tholins: Organic chemistry of interstellar grains and gas.
841	<i>Nature</i> , 279, 102–107, doi:10.1038/277102a0.
842	Sagan, C., B. N. Khare, W. R. Thompson, G. D. McDonald, M. R. Wing, J. L. Bada,
843	T. Vo-Dinh, and E. T. Arakawa (1993), Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in the atmo-
844	spheres of Titan and Jupiter, <i>The Astrophysical Journal</i> , 414, 399–405.
845	Schröder, S. E., E. Karkoschka, and R. D. Lorenz (2012), Bouncing on Titan: Motion of
846 847	340, doi:10.1016/j.pss.2012.08.007.
848	Mastrogiuseppe, M., V. Poggiali, A. Hayes, R. Lorenz, J. Lunine, G. Picardi, R. Seu,
849	E. Flamini, G. Mitri, C. Notarnicola, P. Paillou, and H. Zebker (2014), The bathymetry
850	of a titan sea, <i>Geophysical Research Letters</i> , 41(5), 1432–1437, doi:10.1002/
851	2013GL058618, 2013GL058618.

Table A.1. Electrical properties of material relevant to Titan's surface at 94 K and at 2 frequencies, namely

that of PWA-MIP/HASI and that of the Cassini Radar.

Frequencies	45 Hz		14 GHz		
	$\epsilon'_r$	$\epsilon_r^{\prime\prime} \times 10^{-2}$	$\epsilon_r'$	$\epsilon_r'' \times 10^{-3}$	
Tholins 2%	$4.00 \pm 0.04$	$1.05 \pm 0.03$	1.17 (non-compacted) <sup><math>b</math></sup>	$3.3 \text{ (non-compacted)}^b$	
111011118 2 70			2.33 (compacted) <sup><math>b</math></sup>	20.6 (compacted) <sup><math>b</math></sup>	
Tholins 5%	$4.40\pm0.05$	$1.68\pm0.13$	N/A	N/A	
Tholins 8%	$3.40\pm0.04$	$1.37\pm0.04$	N/A	N/A	
Water ice	3.15 <sup>a</sup>	$0.40^{a}$	$3.13 \pm 0.30^{a}$	$1.30 \pm 0.26^{a}$	
Liquid methane	$1.67^{d}$	N/A	$1.74 \pm 0.03^{c}$	$(4.93 \pm 2.50) \times 10^{-2c}$	

<sup>a</sup> Extrapolated from *Mattei et al.* [2014], <sup>b</sup> [*Paillou et al.*, 2008]

<sup>c</sup> [*Mitchell et al.*, 2015], <sup>d</sup> [*Leese et al.*, 2012] at 100 Hz.

Sciamma-O'Brien, E., N. Carrasco, C. Szopa, A. Buch, and G. Cernogora (2010), Titan's atmosphere: An optimal gas mixture for aerosol production?, *Icarus*, 209, 704–714, doi: 10.1016/j.icarus.2010.04.009.

- Simões, F., R. Trautner, R. Grard, and M. Hamelin (2004), Laboratory Measurements on
   Martian Soil Simulant JSC Mars-1 Supporting the Calibration of Instruments for Planetary Missions, in *Proceedings of the 37th ESLAB Symposium "Tools and Technologies for Future Planetary Exploration"*, vol. 543, pp. 205–209.
- Stern, S. A., L. M. Feaga, E. Schindhelm, A. Steffl, J. W. Parker, P. D. Feldman, H. A.
   Weaver, M. F. A'Hearn, J. Cook, and J. L. Bertaux (2015), First extreme and far ultraviolet spectrum of a Comet Nucleus: Results from 67p/Churyumov-Gerasimenko, *Icarus*, 256, 117–119, doi:10.1016/j.icarus.2015.04.023.
- Szopa, C., G. Cernogora, L. Boufendi, J. J. Correia, and P. Coll (2006), PAMPRE: A
   dusty plasma experiment for Titan's tholins production and study, *Planetary and Space Science*, 54, 394–404, doi:10.1016/j.pss.2005.12.012.
- Tobie, G., O. Grasset, J. I. Lunine, A. Mocquet, and C. Sotin (2005), Titan's internal structure inferred from a coupled thermal-orbital model, *Icarus*, *175*, 496–502, doi: 10.1016/j.icarus.2004.12.007.
- Trainer, M. G., A. A. Pavlov, H. L. DeWitt, J. L. Jimenez, C. P. McKay, O. B. Toon, and M. A. Tolbert (2006), Organic haze on titan and the early earth, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *103*(48), 18,035–18,042, doi:10.1073/pnas.0608561103.
- Turtle, E. P., J. W. Barnes, M. G. Trainer, R. D. Lorenz, S. M. MacKenzie, K. E. Hibbard,
   D. Adams, P. Bedini, J. W. Langelaan, K. Zacny, and Dragonfly Team (2017), Dragon fly: Exploring Titan's Prebiotic Organic Chemistry and Habitability, in *Lunar and Plan*-
- etary Science Conference, Lunar and Planetary Science Conference, vol. 48, p. 1958. Waite, J. H., D. T. Young, T. E. Cravens, A. J. Coates, F. J. Crary, B. Magee, and J. West-
- lake (2007), The Process of Tholin Formation in Titan's Upper Atmosphere, *Science*,
   *316*, 870–875, doi:10.1126/science.1139727.
- Wye, L. C. (2011), Radar Scattering from Titan and Saturn's Icy Satellites Using the Cassini Spacecraft, Ph.D. thesis, Stanford University.
- Wye, L. C., H. A. Zebker, S. J. Ostro, R. D. West, Y. Gim, R. D. Lorenz, and the Cassini RADAR Team (2007), Electrical properties of Titan's surface from Cassini RADAR scatterometer measurements, *Icarus*, *188*, 367–385, doi:10.1016/j.icarus.2006.12.008.
- Zarnecki, J. C., M. R. Leese, B. Hathi, A. J. Ball, A. Hagermann, M. C. Towner, R. D.
- Lorenz, J. A. M. McDonnell, S. F. Green, M. R. Patel, T. J. Ringrose, P. D. Rosenberg,
- K. R. Atkinson, M. D. Paton, M. Banaszkiewicz, B. C. Clark, F. Ferri, M. Fulchignoni,
- N. A. L. Ghafoor, G. Kargl, H. Svedhem, J. Delderfield, M. Grande, D. J. Parker, P. G.
- Challenor, and J. E. Geake (2005), A soft solid surface on Titan as revealed by the
- Huygens Surface Science Package, *Nature*, 438, 792–795, doi:10.1038/nature04211.



Figure A.1. Tholins produced by the PAMPRE experiment with a gas mixture of 92/8 ratio of N2/CH4.



Figure A.2. Real (top) and imaginary (bottom) parts of the complex permittivity of tholins as a function of the porosity of the samples measured for three different compositions. The data points are for a temperature of 94 K and a frequency f = 100 Hz. The continuous lines represent the Maxwell-Garnett mixing law.

Frequency (wavelength)	Region	$\epsilon_r'$	$\epsilon_r''$	Reference
2.4 GHz (13 cm)	Latitude band at 26°S	1.5-2.2 with a mean value of $1.8 \pm 0.3$	N/A	[Campbell et al., 2003]
13.8 GHz	Average over globe	$2.12\pm0.07$	N/A	[Wye et al., 2007]
(2.2 cm)	Plains (HLS-like?)	1.9-3.6 with a mean value of $2.2 \pm 0.05$	N/A	[Wye, 2011]
13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)	Average over globe	1.54	N/A	[Janssen et al., 2016]
	HLS region	$1.7 \pm 0.2$	N/A	
13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)	HLS region	$2.7 \pm 0.25$	$\approx 10^{-3}$	[Janssen et al., 2016]
45 Hz	HLS	$2.55 \pm 0.35$ (<11 min) 2.35 \pm 0.35 (>11 min)	0.2 - 0.8 (<11 min) 0 - 0.1 (>11 min)	[Hamelin et al., 2016]
	Frequency (wavelength)         2.4 GHz (13 cm)         13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)         13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)         13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)         13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)         45 Hz	Frequency (wavelength)Region2.4 GHz (13 cm)Latitude band at 26°S13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe - Plains (HLS-like?)13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe - Flains (HLS region13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe - Flains Over globe - Flains Over globe - Region13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average - Average over globe - HLS region13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)HLS region	Frequency (wavelength)Region $\epsilon'_r$ 2.4 GHz (13 cm)Latitude band at 26°S1.5-2.2 with a mean value of $1.8 \pm 0.3$ 13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe (HLS-like?)2.12 \pm 0.0713.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe - HLS region2.12 \pm 0.0713.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average - 0 er globe - 1.5 region1.5413.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average - 0 er globe - 1.7 ± 0.21.7 ± 0.213.8 GHz (2.2 cm)HLS region2.7 ± 0.2513.8 GHz (2.2 cm)HLS region2.7 ± 0.2513.8 GHz (2.2 cm)HLS region2.7 ± 0.35 (<11 min)	Frequency (wavelength)Region $\epsilon'_r$ $\epsilon''_r$ 2.4 GHz (13 cm)Latitude band at 26°S1.5-2.2 with a mean value of $1.8 \pm 0.3$ N/A13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe (HLS-like?)2.12 $\pm 0.07$ N/A13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average over globe - Fains (HLS region)2.12 $\pm 0.07$ N/A13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average - Fains over globe - HLS region1.54N/A13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)Average - T.7 $\pm 0.2$ N/AN/A13.8 GHz (2.2 cm)HLS region2.7 $\pm 0.25$ $\approx 10^{-3}$ 45 HzHLSHLS $(<11 min)$ $(<11 min)$ $(<11 min)$ $(<11 min)$

Table A.2. Remote sensing (from the Earth and the Cassini spacecraft) and in-situ (with the Huygens probe) 893 measurements of the electrical properties of the first meters of Titan's subsurface. 894



Figure A.3. Real and imaginary parts of the complex permittivity of bulk tholins as a function of frequency
 for three different temperatures and compositions (2% (a), 5% (b) and 8% (c) of methane in the initial gas
 mixture).



Figure A.4. Frequency (at a temperature of 94 K, column a) and temperature (at a frequency of 100 Hz, column b) dependence and of the real and imaginary parts of the complex permittivity of bulk tholins obtained for 3 gas mixture compositions.



Figure A.5. Complex permittivity at a temperature of 94 K in the complex plane. The best Cole-Cole fit is also represented. The scales for  $\epsilon'_r$  and  $\epsilon''_r$  are different in order to provide a readable figure.



Figure A.6. Ternary diagrams showing the constraints on the composition of the Huygens Landing Site
as derived from both PWA-MIP/HASI (red) and the Cassini Radar (blue) observations and assuming that the
subsurface pores are saturated with liquid methane (a), half-filled with liquid (b) or empty (c). The intersection of the constraints (gray area) represents the most likely composition of the first meter below the surface
of the HLS. To help read this diagram, an example is shown (green squares) on the figure, corresponding to a

![](_page_24_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_24_Figure_3.jpeg)

**Figure A.7.** Upper and lower limits of the imaginary part of the permittivity of the superficial conduc-

tive layer required to explain PWA-MIP/HASI measurements. These limits were obtained by using the two

extreme cases of the probe attitude at the surface of Titan. The values at 7 mm were extrapolated